

An Garda Síochána

Oifig Saorála Fáisnéise,
An Garda Síochána, Teach áth Luimnigh,
Lárionad Gnó Udáras Forbartha Tionscail,
Baile Sheáin, An Uaimh,
Contae na Mí.
C15 DR90



Freedom of Information Office,
An Garda Síochána, Athlumney House,
IDA Business Park,
Johnstown, Navan,
Co Meath.
C15 DR90

Teileafón/Tel: (046) 9036350



Láithreán Gréasain/Website:
www.garda.ie

Ríomh-phoist/Email: foi@garda.ie

Re: Freedom of Information Request FOI-000331-2023 Request Part-Grant

I refer to your request, dated 29th September, 2023 and received on 2nd October, 2023 which you have made under the Freedom of Information Act 2014 (FOI Act) for records held by An Garda Síochána.

Part 1(n) of Schedule 1 of the FOI Act states that An Garda Síochána is listed as a partially included agency "*insofar as it relates to administrative records relating to human resources, or finance or procurement matters*". Therefore, only administrative records that relate to human resources, finance or procurement shall be considered.

Your request sought:

Under the FOI Act 2014, I am seeking a copy of the invoices/receipts/purchase orders associated with the following transactions:

225416 - Sheraton Athlone - Hotel Room Hire - €28,510.04
225632 - MMI Group Ltd - Promotional Goods & Services - €88,478.00
226304 - St Julians School - Education Services - €22,736.00
228616 - Roarty Associates Ltd - Room Hire - €22,568.81
226708 - Grand Hotel Malahide - Room hire - €20,411.71
221523 - International School of Lyon - Education Services - €37,433.00

I wish to inform you that I have decided to part-grant your request on 24th October, 2023. The purpose of this letter is to explain that decision.

1. Findings, particulars and reasons for decision

I am partially granting a number of records which are subject of your FOI request. The exemptions applied are explained below.

I am refusing to release the individual unit prices of suppliers pursuant to Section 36(b) and (c) of the FOI Act which states:

Commercially sensitive information

36. (1) Subject to subsection (2), a head shall refuse to grant an FOI request if the record concerned contains—

- (b) *financial, commercial, scientific or technical or other information whose disclosure could reasonably be expected to result in a material financial loss or gain to the person to whom the information relates, or could prejudice the competitive position of that person in the conduct of his or her profession or business or otherwise in his or her occupation, or***
- (c) *information whose disclosure could prejudice the conduct or outcome of contractual or other negotiations of the person to whom the information relates.***

I am satisfied that the release of supplier costs would prejudice the competitive position of the supplier by making their cost per unit publically known. This information therefore is commercially sensitive in accordance with the provisions of Section 36 of the Act.

I am cognisant of the fact that the release of information under the Act is, in essence, a release to the public at large. The pricing structure of suppliers with regard to services provided to An Garda Síochána are not known to competitors or the public in general. If the records were made available to you it is reasonable to expect that it would prejudice the ability of suppliers to compete in other contracts or negotiations.

I am of the view that the release of the pricing structures could reasonably be expected to result in a material financial loss by the suppliers as it could prejudice their competitive position in the conduct of their business. The placing of these pricing structures into the public domain could also reasonably be expected to give a competitive advantage to other companies seeking similar contracts with public bodies.

Furthermore the supplier's current customers may become aware of a potential difference in pricing structures being offered to An Garda Síochána which could prejudice any current or future negotiations with these customers.

Therefore, I am refusing to release the relevant parts of the records under the provisions of section 36(1)(b) & 36(1)(c) as to do so would release commercially sensitive information into the public domain.

Public Interest Test

There is a Public Interest Test associated with section 36 of the FOI Act whereby my decision must be made having fully considered the public interest relevant to this request.

I have considered the public interest issues which arise in this case and have taken account of the following factors in favour of release:

- Ensuring openness and transparency of organisational functions to the greatest possible extent.
- The public interest in members of the public exercising their rights under the FOI Act.

- That there is more than just a transitory interest by the public in this information being released.
- The right to commercial confidentiality is outweighed by the needs of the public regarding the expenditure of public funds by a public body.

In considering the public interest factors which favour withholding the records I have taken account of the following:

- Allowing a public body to hold commercial information without undue access by members of the public.
- The best course of action which is in the public interest with regard to these records.
- That An Garda Síochána can conduct its business with external contractors in a confidential manner.
- That there is a reasonable and implied expectation by contractors that financial information pertaining to services provided will be held in a confidential manner.
- That there is no overriding public interest that outweighs the right to privacy by an individual or in this case the financial activities of a service provider.

Having balanced the public interest factors both for and against the release, I decided that the public interest in preserving the information and the reasonable expectation that information can be maintained by An Garda Síochána without prejudicing future financial endeavors by external service providers outweighs the public interest which would be served were the records released to you.

Section 37 – Personal Information

Under the FOI Act, records are released without any restriction as to how they may be used and thus, release under the FOI Act, is in effect, and regarded as being released to the world at large. As a result, I am conscious of my obligations to retain personal information in a confidential and secure manner and prevent personal information from being released into the public domain unnecessarily. Section 2 of the FOI Act defines personal information as follows:

2.(1) *In this Act—*

"personal information" means information about an identifiable individual that, either—

(a) would, in the ordinary course of events, be known only to the individual or members of the family, or friends, of the individual, or

(b) is held by an FOI body on the understanding that it would be treated by that body as confidential,

Section 37 provides that a public body shall refuse to grant a request if access to the record concerned would involve the disclosure of personal information. Furthermore, Section 37(7) provides that a public body shall refuse to grant a request if access to the record concerned would, in addition to involving the disclosure of personal information relating to the requester, also involve the disclosure of personal information relating to an individual or individuals other than the requester, commonly referred to as joint personal information.

I am satisfied that parts of certain records relate to a third party, as well as information relating to other individuals who are named in the records. As such, I am satisfied that the records

consist of the personal information of these third parties. Accordingly, I find that Section 37(1) and (7) of the Act applies to the records at issue.

Section 37(1) and (7) of the FOI Act are as follows:

37(1) Subject to this section, a head shall refuse to grant an FOI request if, in the opinion of the head, access to the record concerned would involve the disclosure of personal information (including personal information relating to a deceased individual)

(7) Notwithstanding paragraph (a) of subsection (2), a head shall, subject to paragraphs (b) to (e) of that subsection and subsections (5) and (8), refuse to grant an FOI request if, in the opinion of the head, access to the record concerned would, in addition to involving the disclosure of personal information relating to the requester, also involve the disclosure of personal information relating to an individual or individuals other than the requester.

As section 37 requires a public interest test be carried out, I have considered the public interest issues which arise in this case and have taken account of the following factors in favour of release:

- Ensuring openness and transparency of organisational functions to the greatest possible extent,
- The public interest in members of the public exercising their rights under the FOI Act,
- That there is more than just a transitory interest by the public in this information,
- The right to privacy is outweighed by the needs of the public.

In considering the public interest factors which favour withholding the records, I have taken account of the following:

- The public interest is not best served by releasing these records,
- That the Organisation can conduct its business in a confidential manner,
- That there is a reasonable and implied expectation that sensitive personal information will remain confidential,
- That there is no overriding public interest that outweighs the individual's right to privacy.
- Allowing a public body to hold personal information without undue access by members of the public,

A public interest test was carried out when considering the release of the records but, having balanced the factors both for and against the release, I have decided that the public interest in preserving personal information would best be served by particular parts of the records provided.

2. Right of Appeal

In the event that you are not happy with this decision you may seek an Internal Review of the matter by writing to the address below and quoting reference number **FOI-000331-2023**.

Freedom of Information Office, An Garda Síochána, Athlumney House, IDA Business Park, Johnstown, Navan, Co. Meath C15 DR90

Please note that a fee applies. This fee has been set at €30 (€10 for a Medical Card holder). Payment should be made by way of bank draft, money order, postal order or personal cheque,

4

and made payable to Accountant, Garda Finance Directorate, Garda Headquarters, Phoenix Park, Dublin 8. Payment can be made by electronic means, using the following details:

Account Name: An Garda Síochána Imprest Account

Account Number: 30000302

Sort Code: 951599

IBAN: IE28DABA95159930000302

BIC: DABAIE2D

You must ensure that your FOI reference number (FOI-000331-2023) is included in the payment details.

You should submit your request for an Internal Review within 4 weeks from the date of this notification. The review will involve a complete reconsideration of the matter by a more senior member of An Garda Síochána and the decision will be communicated to you within 3 weeks. The making of a late appeal may be permitted in appropriate circumstances.

Please be advised that An Garda Síochána replies under Freedom of Information may be released in to the public domain via our website at www.garda.ie. Personal details in respect of your request have, where applicable, been removed to protect confidentiality.

Should you have any questions or concerns regarding the above, please contact the FOI Office by telephone at (046) 9036350.

Yours sincerely,



ASSISTANT PRINCIPAL

PAUL BASSETT

FREEDOM OF INFORMATION OFFICER

29th OCTOBER, 2023.