An Garda Síochána

Oifig Saorála Fáisnéise, An Garda Síochána, Teach áth Luimnigh, Lárionad Gnó Udáras Forbartha Tionscail, Baile Sheáin, An Uaimh, Contae na Mí. C15 DR90



Freedom of Information Office, An Garda Síochána, Athlumney House, IDA Business Park, Johnstown, Navan, Co Meath. C15 DR90

Teileafón/Tel: (046) 9036350

Bí linn/Join us



Láithreán Gréasain/Website: www.garda.ie

Ríomh-phoist:/Email: foi@garda.ie

Re: Access to Information on the Environment (AIE) Regulations Request AIE-004-2025 Request Part-Grant

Dear

I refer to your request, dated 2nd June, 2025 and received 3rd June, 2025 which you have made under the Access to Information on the Environment (AIE) Regulations for records held by An Garda Síochána.

Your request sought:

Under the AIE Regulations, I am seeking the following information on the fleet of cars in use for officeholders, including the Taoiseach, Tánaiste, Ministers, and other officeholders provided with transport AGS: • A full list of all cars in the fleet including make, year, mileage and fuel type/electric hybrid and which officeholder the vehicle is assigned • Details of all purchases and disposals of vehicles in the period 29 May 2024 to date including the purchase price of vehicles or sale price/scrappage costs any vehicles that have been disposed of.

The AIE Regulations are based on Directive 2003/4/EC. The Regulations provide for the right of access to environmental information held by or for public authorities and set out the basic terms and conditions of, and practical arrangements for, the exercise of this right of access. In line with Article 2(1) of the Directive, Article 3(1) of the AIE Regulations defines "environmental information" as "any information in written, visual, aural, electronic or any other material form on —

(a) The state of the elements of the environment, such as air and atmosphere, water, soil, land, landscape and natural sites... and the interaction among these elements,

- (b) Factors, such as substances, energy, noise, radiation or waste, including radioactive waste, emissions, discharges and other releases into the environment, affecting or likely to affect the elements of the environment,
- (c) Measures (including administrative measures), such as policies, legislation, plans, programmes, environmental agreements, and activities affecting or likely to affect the elements and factors referred to in paragraphs (a) and (b) as well as measures or activities designed to protect those elements,
- (d) Reports on the implementation of environmental legislation,
- (e) Cost benefit and other economic analyses and assumptions used within the framework of the measures and activities referred to in paragraph (c), and
- (f) The state of human health and safety... conditions of human life, cultural sites and built structures... affected by the state of the elements of the environment... or through those elements, by any of the matters referred to in paragraph (b) and (c)".

I wish to inform you that I have decided to <u>part-grant</u> your request on 26th June 2025. The purpose of this letter is to explain my decision.

1. Findings, particulars and reasons for decision

Upon receipt, your request was forwarded to Fleet Management Section and a number of records have been forwarded to this Office.

In Part 1 of your request you seek "A full list of all cars in the fleet including make, year, mileage and fuel type/electric hybrid etc. and which officeholder the vehicle is assigned to". The information you requested in relation to the year, make, fuel type and mileage of ministerial vehicles are detailed in the table below.

Officeholder's fleet as at 31/05/2025

Year	Make	Fuel Type	Mileage
2013	AUDI A6 3.0TDI QUATR	DIESEL	331,429
2022	AUDI A6 3.0TDI QUATR	DIESEL	228,139
2022	AUDI A6 3.0TDI QUATR	DIESEL	205,000
2014	BMW 730 4DR AUTO	DIESEL	298,097
2016	BMW 530D	DIESEL	275,458
2016	BMW 530D	DIESEL	284,054
2017	F/TRANSIT CUSTOM M/B	DIESEL	114,403
2017	BMW 740	DIESEL	358,172
2019	BMW 530D	DIESEL	327,598
2019	BMW 530D	DIESEL	219,661
2022	AUDI A6 3.0TDI QUATR	DIESEL	199,572
2022	AUDI A6 3.0TDI QUATR	DIESEL	191,340
2022	AUDI A6 3.0TDI QUATR	DIESEL	237,542
2016	BMW 530D	DIESEL	293,647
2019	AUDI A6 3.0TDI QUATR	DIESEL	310,763
2024	AUDI A6 50 TDI QUATT	DIESEL	56,780
2024	AUDI A6 50 TDI QUATT	DIESEL	41,882
2024	AUDI A6 50 TDI QUATT	DIESEL	37,775
2024	AUDI A6 50 TDI QUATT	DIESEL	31,355
2023	HYUNDAI IONIQ6 77KW	ELECTRIC	22,705

2022	HY IONIQ5 PREM AWD	ELECTRIC	61,200
2019	LEXUS LUXURY LS500H	HYBRID/U/L	292,086
2011	AUDI A6 50TFSI E	PLUG IN HYBRID	150,996
2024	AUDI A8 L 60 TFSI E	PLUG IN HYBRID	38,977
2024	AUDI A6 50TFSI E	PLUG IN HYBRID	23,605
2022	AUDI A6 50TFSI E	PLUG IN HYBRID	74,500
2022	AUDI A6 50TFSI E	PLUG IN HYBRID	172,485
2022	AUDI A6 50TFSI E	PLUG IN HYBRID	79,440
2022	AUDI A6 50TFSI E	PLUG IN HYBRID	107,070
2022	AUDI A6 50TFSI E	PLUG IN HYBRID	125,993
2022	AUDI A6 50TFSI E	PLUG IN HYBRID	105,717
2022	AUDI A6 50TFSI E	PLUG IN HYBRID	154,017
2022	AUDI A6 50TFSI E	PLUG IN HYBRID	120,548
2022	AUDI A6 50TFSI E	PLUG IN HYBRID	129,024
2024	AUDI A6 50TFSI E	PLUG IN HYBRID	45,621
2021	AUDI A6 50TFSI E	PLUG IN HYBRID	108,238
2021	AUDI A6 50TFSI E	PLUG IN HYBRID	104,811
2011	AUDI A6 50TFSI E	PLUG IN HYBRID	187,676
2024	AUDI A6 50TFSI E	PLUG IN HYBRID	42,610
2024	AUDI A6 50TFSI E	PLUG IN HYBRID	36,707
2023	AUDI Q7 TFSIE HYBRD	PLUG IN HYBRID	41,092

I am refusing the part of your request that states "which officeholder the vehicle is assigned to" as this information does not constitute "environmental information" as defined by the AIE Regulations. The requested information does not satisfy any of the 6 criteria above, which for the purposes of the Regulations define "environmental information".

The European Court of Justice has found that while the AIE Regulations provide a broad definition of the term "environmental information", they are not intended to give a general and unlimited right of access to all information held by public authorities which has a connection, however minimal, with one of the environmental factors mentioned. This view has been affirmed by the Commissioner for Environmental Information in decision CEI/15/0007 where the Commissioner held that "in order for the AIE Regulations to apply, information must have more than a minimal connection to the state of the elements of the environment".

In reaching this decision, I am mindful of a previous decision of the Commissioner for Environmental Information (Gavin Sheridan & the Central Bank of Ireland, CEI/11/001) wherein the Commissioner determined that in order for information to fall within the definition of environmental information, it must be "indicative of the environmental impact of the activity to which it relates". I am of the view that the connection between the requested information, namely the identity of the office holder, and any impact on the environment is too remote to qualify as environmental information.

Having examined your request, I am satisfied that the records of which officeholder the vehicle was assigned to does not constitute "environmental information" as defined by Article 3(1) of the AIE Regulations. Therefore, these records cannot be released under the Regulations.

In Part 2 of your request seeks "Details of all purchases and disposals of vehicles in the period 29 May 2024 to date including the purchase price of vehicles or sale price/scrappage costs of any vehicles that have been disposed of."

The table below outlines the number of vehicles purchased and disposed of from May 2024 to May 2025.

Allocated / Removed 29th May 2024 to 31st May 2025

DATE	ALLOCATED	REMOVED
29/05/2024 - 31/05/2025	11	2 .

There were 11 vehicles purchased between 29th May 2024 and 31st May 2025 at a total cost of €913,840.51.

I have not included the individual price of the purchase of vehicles as this is commercially confidential information. This is in accordance with the provisions of Article 9(1) (c) of the AIE Regulations wherein

- 9. (1) A public authority may refuse to make available environmental information where disclosure of the information requested would adversely affect—
 - (c) commercial or industrial confidentiality, where such confidentiality is provided for in national or Community law to protect a legitimate economic interest, or

I am satisfied that the release of the unit cost charged by a supplier for individual goods or services amounts to the release of commercially or industrially confidential information and that the release of such information would adversely affect the supplier by prejudicing their competitive position.

I am cognisant of the fact that the release of information under the AIE Regulations is, in essence, a release to the public at large. The pricing structure of a supplier with regard to goods or services provided to An Garda Síochána is not known to competitors or the public in general. If this information were made publically available it is reasonable to expect that it would prejudice the ability of a supplier to compete in other contracts or negotiations in the future as competitors would be aware of their pricing structure.

In addition, I consider that there is a public interest in allowing An Garda Síochána conduct its business with external contractors in a confidential manner and having the ability to hold commercial information in respect of suppliers without undue access by members of the public. Furthermore there is a reasonable and implied expectation by contractors that financial information pertaining to services provided will be held in a confidential manner.

Article 10(1) of the Regulations requires that a request for environmental information shall not be refused, pursuant to Article 9(1) (c), where the request relates to information on emissions into the environment. I am satisfied that the refused information in this part of your request does not constitute information on emissions into the environment.

In accordance with Articles 10(3) and (4) of the AIE Regulations, I have considered the above factors as supporting the public interest in refusing the release of commercially confidential information, i.e. the individual cost of purchase and end of life for ministerial vehicles.

I have also considered a number of public interest issues which favour the release of the sections of the records in question, namely the requirement to provide to the greatest extent possible for access by the public to information on the environment, ensuring openness and transparency of An Garda Síochána's functions, the public interest in members of the public exercising their rights under the AIE Regulations, the need for the public to be better informed on environmental affairs and the importance of scrutiny in respect of the expenditure of public funds.

However, I am not satisfied that the release of this particular financial information enhances the degree of environmental information available to the public to such an extent as to override the right of suppliers of goods and services to An Garda Síochána to confidentiality in their commercial dealings. Having balanced the public interest factors both for and against the release, I have decided that the public interest in preserving the information and the reasonable expectation that information can be maintained by An Garda Síochána without prejudicing future financial endeavors by external service providers outweighs the public interest which would be served were the records released to you

2. Right of Appeal

Under Article 11 of the AIE Regulations you have a right to seek an internal review of this decision. An internal review involves a complete reconsideration of the matter by a member of the staff of this Organisation, of the same or higher rank than the original decision-maker, who may affirm, vary or annul the original decision made. The decision of this review will be communicated to you within one month of receipt of your application for an internal review.

In the event that you wish to make such an appeal, you can do so by writing to, *Freedom of Information Office*, *An Garda Siochána*, *Athlumney House*, *IDA Business Park*, *Johnstown*, *Navan*, *Co. Meath C15 DR90* referring to this decision and quoting your AIE reference number. You must make this request within one month of the date of this notification, (the making of a late appeal may be permitted in appropriate circumstances).

Should you have any questions or concerns regarding the above, please contact me by telephone at (046) 9036350.

ASSISTANT PRINCIPAL

Yours sincerely,

PAUL BASSETT

FREEDOM OF INFORMATION OFFICER

46 June 2025