March 2002

communiqué

IN THIS ISSUE

IN THE NEXT ISSUE

Letters to the Editor
Letters will be welcomed by the editor and
should be addressed to

Peter Fitzgerald, The Editor, Communique,
Office of Deputy Commissioner SRM,
Garda Headquarters, Phoenix Park, Dublin 8.

Short articles which meet the criteria in Notes for
Contributors overleaf will be welcomed by the
Editorial Board.

CONTENTS

Clare O'Sullivan

Jerry Keohane

Peter Fitzgerald

Patricia Gill   *David Kavanagh*

Donal Collins

John Kelly

1

NOTES ON THE CONTRIBUTORS

DOCTOR DONAL COLLINS, MB BCH DCH MICG HDOH LFOM MFOM FFOM qualified with a Primary Degree in Medicine from Trinity College Dublin in 1977and was appointed as Chief Medical Officer to An Garda Siochana on 1/8/2000. He worked in a number of Dublin Hospitals and worked for the Mid Western Health Board in Limerick Regional Hospital for two years prior to taking up an appointment with the Army Medical Corps. He qualified initially in general practice and later became interested in occupational medicine while serving with the Army Medical Corps. He is actively involved in the Irish Society of Occupational Medicine and in the Faculty of Occupational Medicine and was past Honorary Secretary of the Society. He served overseas in the Lebanon on five overseas missions and saw the need for great co-operation and planning between the many different specialised units of the many different countries involved.

GARDA PATRICIA GILL, from Westport, Co. Mayo, is attached to the Organisation Development Unit. She joined An Garda Síochána in 1994 and served in Dun Laoghaire until 2000, when she was selected as a McCabe Scholar at John Jay College of Criminal Justice, New York. She holds a Bachelor of Arts in Psychology from Trinity College in 2000 and she graduated from John Jay College with a Masters in Forensic Psychology in 2001. A 400-hour externship with the Psychological Services Section of the NYPD formed part of her New York studies.

2

SERGEANT DAVID KAVANAGH joined An Garda Síochána in 1980. He served in Dublin at Harcourt Terrace, Pearse Street and the Crime Task Force, and in Laois/Offaly in various stations. He was the Divisional Crime Prevention Officer when he joined the Organisation Development Unit at Garda HQ in February 2000. Sergeant Kavanagh holds a BA in Public Management (Administration of Justice) from the Institute of Public Administration and an MA in Criminal Justice from John Jay College, New York.

SUPERINTENDENT JOHN KELLY is a native of Tuam, Co. Galway who joined An Garda Síochána in 1970 and is currently the Superintendent in charge of the 'F' District, D.M.R. East. He has previously served in Harcourt Terrace, Kevin Street, Pearse Street, Stepaside, Kilmainham, Ballyfermot, Ballyconnell, Co. Cavan, Crime Branch, Garda H.Q., and Blackrock, D.M.R. East. While at Crime Branch, he was a member of several Working Groups, including the Task Force on Suicide and is currently on the Commission of Liquor Licensing. He has been a Garda delegate at EU meetings, attended conferences and chaired workshops at EU funded programmes. He attended the Dutch Senior Police College, Rhineland Police College and has lectured at the Garda College. He holds a B.A. degree in Police Management.

SERGEANT JEREMIAH KEOHANE, a native of Cork city, joined An Garda Síochána in 1989 with a B.A. (Hons.) in Sociology from UCC. He served in Dundalk for five years, completed a post-graduate Diploma in the Psychology of Criminal Behaviour at the National College of Ireland and joined the staff of the Student/Probationer School at the Garda College, where he thought Psychology to Garda Students and Probationers until September 1998. He completed an M.Sc. in Forensic and Legal Psychology with the University of Leicester where his research interest centred on the differential impact of emotional arousal on eyewitness memory accuracy. He holds an N.C.E.A. Diploma in Police Studies, a Diploma in Quality Management from the University of Limerick, a Diploma in Advanced Management, and an MBA Degree from the Smurfit Business School, University College Dublin. He is an accredited internal assessor with the EFQM. In July 2001 he joined the Organisation Development Unit, Garda Headquarters.

CLARE O'SULLIVAN is Superintendent in charge of Programme Co-Ordination in Information Technology. She also represents An Garda Síochána at Europol, The Hague, on the implementation of the Europol Information System and other technical matters. She joined An Garda Síochána in 1981 and served in Cork City, Command and Control, Harcourt Square and Information Technology Division. She holds a BA Degree in Public Management, awarded by the Institute of Public Administration as well as a Masters of Business Administration (MBA), awarded by the Michael Smurfit Graduate School of Business, University College Dublin in 2001. She lectures to the Batchelor of Arts Degree (Police Management) programme at the Garda College on Information Technology.

Migration Management –
Lessons Ireland can learn from other countries

Superintendent Clare O'Sullivan

Claire O'Sullivan

This article is an extract from a research-based dissertation on Migration Management submitted by the author in part fulfillment of an MBA in the Smurfit Business School in August 2001.

Man has always traveled the world to satisfy his needs for a better and safer place to live. Now the people of the world are witnessing movements as never before. The gap between rich and poor regions is getting wider. In economies where economic deprivation, oppression or dictatorial regimes prevail more and more, people know where the opportunities exist and are prepared to travel. On the other hand many developed economies, faced with declining and ageing populations, require workers to sustain their economies and societies for the future. More sinister forces are also at work; organised crime is now run on an international basis and the trafficking of people and children has become big business.

Migration is described as a permanent or semi permanent change of residence of an individual or a group of people. People, who leave their country and transfer their usual place of residence outside the country for more than a minimal amount of time, are regarded by the UN Statistical Commission and Eurostat (2001) as international emigrants. On the other hand a person is considered an international immigrant, if he or she enters a specific country to settle in his/her usual place of residence for more than the same minimal duration. The term migration is descriptive of the process of the movement of persons, and therefore includes the movement of people such as economic migrants, refugees and asylum seekers.

An economic migrant or a migrant worker is described as a person who is to be engaged, is engaged or has been engaged, in a remunerated activity in a state of which he or she is not a national. According to the 1951 Convention relating to the Status of Refugees, a refugee is a person who "owing to a well founded fear of persecution for reasons of race, religion, nationality, membership of a particular social group, or political opinion, is outside the country of his nationality, and is unable to or, owing to such fear, is unwilling to avail himself of the protection of that country". An asylum seeker is a person who has left their country of origin, has applied for recognition as a refugee in another country, and is awaiting a decision on their application. Ireland has also received what are known as Programme Refugees from countries such as Vietnam and Kosovo. A Programme Refugee is a person who has been given leave to enter and remain in the state for temporary protection or resettlement as part of a group of persons.

3

communique

AN GARDA SÍOCHÁNA MANAGEMENT JOURNAL

Ireland has a long history of emigration but has recently found itself as a recipient country for immigrants. This has resulted in new challenges for government, organisations, communities and individuals. Many other countries have a long history of receiving and integrating immigrants, but have also been challenged by the increased pace and scale of immigration in recent years. The purpose of this article is to look at some of the broad lessons that Ireland can learn from countries with longer histories of managing migration. While policing in Ireland is concerned with the control of immigration, many issues arising from the failure to manage the broader issues of migration pose challenges for society and, as a consequence, for policing.

4

LESSON 1 – COMPREHENSIVE UP TO DATE INFORMATION ON MIGRATION IS NECESSARY.

The nature of migration means that there is a real absence of data on the subject. Many immigrants enter countries legally on tourist visas. Those with visas scatter around the country and are not easy to locate, but they represent a major part of immigration flows. Immigrants may also find themselves in illegal situations purely for administrative reasons. A Report on Migration to the EU (2000) highlights that effective management of immigration presupposes the availability of detailed statistics about immigration into the European Union and stresses the need for a uniform data compilation system for monitoring immigration in each member state. This is also borne out by Visco (2000) who says that statistical information is patchy, incomplete and not readily comparable across countries. While research is being done in most countries the OECD (2001) point out that in many cases it has not been translated into policy.

LESSON 2 - MIGRATION REQUIREMENTS NEED TO BE DEFINED

An important part of migration management is determining the migration requirements for a country. This involves having an in-depth understanding of the demographic, economic and labour market requirements in the short and long term. In terms of demography, Ireland continues to record population growth. According to Eurostat figures, the highest birth rate in Europe is in Ireland where there are 14.3 births per 1000 inhabitants. In comparison the lowest rate is in Italy with 9.1 births for every 1000 inhabitants. Labour market concerns are also to the fore in Europe. At the moment there are five workers for each retired person in Europe. By 2050 this ratio will have decreased and there will be two workers for each retired person. While the demographic and labour market situation in Ireland is not as critical as in other EU countries, it is not anticipated that population growth arising from births in Ireland will continue at the present rate of 23,000 natural increase each year.

Borjas, (1999), has found that a country needs to consider two fundamental questions regarding immigration. Firstly, how many

immigrants does a country need and secondly, what kind of skills and other qualifications should they bring with them. Migration of skilled labour has played a very important part in Ireland's competitiveness during the 1990's. However, Ireland's 'native' labour market is effectively moving up the value chain into the skilled area. The effect of this now and in the future is that Ireland will require greater numbers of unskilled workers. Evidence from other countries suggests that by and large, skilled workers are mobile and will move in the event of a downturn. This does not apply to the same extent for unskilled workers.

In determining immigration requirements, the lessons from other countries suggest that while there are opportunities for Ireland to implement policies to help prevent the population decline that is a cause for concern in other EU countries, the reality is that the population of the future will be a combination of native born and immigrant. The number of unskilled immigrants and people seeking asylum will also increase and the long-term consequences of these migrants will have to be considered, particularly in the event of an economic downturn. The experience of France and Germany in particular, show that temporary workers or 'guest workers' do not return to their home country in the event of an economic downturn.

5

LESSON 3 - IMMIGRATION HAS MANY BENEFITS FOR THE HOST COUNTRY
Ireland has experienced remarkable economic performance in the last decade with annual average growth of 8.3 per cent in the period 1997-1999. The total number of foreign residents in Ireland (3.3 per cent of the population) is small relative to other EU countries, but these numbers are increasing. Figures from the Central Statistics Office (2001) show that in April 2001 the population of Ireland reached 3.84 million. Net immigration reached a historic highpoint of 26,300 with the number of immigrants increasing to 46,200 and the number of emigrants declining to a record low of 19,900. During the period April 2000-2001 thirty nine percent of the immigrants were returned Irish nationals. The main reasons people migrate to Ireland are for work, study and family reunification. Typical immigrants into Ireland are a highly educated group and are assisting in allowing economic growth to continue. Barrett and Trace (1998) found that in the period 1994 –1996 returned migrants and immigrants had higher levels of educational attainment than the domestic population. For example, 12.7 per cent of the domestic labour force aged 30-39 had university degrees, 28 per cent of returned migrants had degrees and the corresponding figure for immigrants was 43.2 per cent.
Migrants are by nature risk takers and show lots of initiative. In many cases they leave their own country and travel, often through difficult circumstances, to a country that does not speak their language and has a very different culture. European statistics show that two thirds of

children of immigrants are likely to set up their own businesses. It is widely accepted that immigration has been very beneficial for many countries including Ireland, in enabling a flexible response to economic growth, increasing competitiveness, introducing new skills and broadening cultural awareness.

LESSON 4 – UNDERSTANDING THE CAPACITY OF THE COUNTRY TO ABSORB MIGRANTS IS IMPORTANT

The Irish Commission for Justice and Peace (1999), point out that an immigration policy has of necessity to be sustainable in terms of the host country's capacity to absorb inflows of people from widely different cultural, linguistic religious and ethnic background. Other writers, most notably Visco (2000), stress the importance of carefully examining and assessing the impact of migration. This should include the impact on the native population as concerns the labour market, the pressures that immigration might add on education, housing and health facilities as well as potential environmental impacts. While there are significant positive consequences from migration there are also serious political challenges especially when migrant flows are disorderly and concentrated in local areas. Many modern observers are suggesting that the USA would find it easier to absorb their existing bulge of immigrants (upwards of 1.3 million new arrivals, legal and illegal each year), if there was a partial reduction of the inflow for a period of years. They point to places like California where they say that one of the biggest problems is simply that the number of immigrants has climbed too high for assimilation purposes.

Ireland must take cognisance of the level of immigration relative to the size of the population, the pace of immigration, the unemployment level, the demands that immigration will place on existing infrastructure in terms of housing, transportation, education, health and spatial development. Integration of immigrants, particularly in relation to language, education and culture is crucial to the long-term success of migration management and the prevention of racial discrimination.

The total number of incidents of all types responded to by Gardaí has increased by seven per cent over the past five years. A very small proportion of all incidents involve migrants as victims or as offenders. The impact of migrants on the criminal justice system in Ireland is much wider than this however, as the system is the first migration manager encountered and issues such as human rights, combating racialism, training requirements, translation, differing culture and knowledge bases, legal interpretation and cross-agency responsibilities are all being addressed.

LESSON 5 - THE NUMBER OF PEOPLE SEEKING ASYLUM IN IRELAND IS LIKELY TO CONTINUE TO INCREASE

The number of people seeking asylum around the world has tripled over the past ten years. The main reasons for this rise include, civil conflict, the break up of empires and the gap in terms of security and prosperity between the richer stable countries and poorer unstable countries. Europe receives less than a third of global refugees and asylum seekers. It is interesting that poorer neighbouring third world countries in Africa and Asia host most.

Asylum applications in Ireland have increased from 39 in 1992 to 10,938 in 2000. According to the Department of Justice Equality and Law Reform, about seven percent of asylum applications in the State are entitled to Refugee status. Any perception that Ireland is an 'easy' country for asylum is not borne out by comparative analysis. Ireland's recognition rates are significantly lower than the UNHCR rate for the main industrialised countries. For example the Irish recognition rates for Nigeria and Romania are 4.8 per cent and 1.4 per cent compared with a UNHCR average of 7.3 per cent for Nigeria and 2 per cent for Romania and an average rate for sample industrialised countries of 10 per cent and 5 per cent for both countries (UNHCR 1998).

The number of unaccompanied children seeking asylum is of concern. The UNHCR reckons that about five percent of the refugees in the world are separated children who find themselves in a very vulnerable position. In three years the numbers arriving in Ireland has soared from 2 in 1997 to 304 in 2000. According to the Irish Refugee Council most of the unaccompanied children arriving in Ireland were aged between 16 and 18. While there are younger children arriving unaccompanied, they generally have relatives here.

LESSON 6 – THE IMPACT OF FAMILY REUNION POLICIES MUST BE CONSIDERED

The evidence from other countries suggests that family reunion will be the single largest element of immigration in the future. According to the OECD, despite the marked increase in asylum applications and in labour migration, family linked migration predominated in total inflows in almost all OECD member countries in 1998/1999, notably Canada, the United States and France. In the majority of European countries the restrictions placed on immigration over the course of the last two decades have had the effect of rendering family reunion the principal legal means of new immigrants to enter these countries (OECD, 2001). In the USA only twenty one percent of recent legal immigration has been for employment purposes with seventy one percent for family reunification. A further 8 per cent is diversity orientated. In Australia and Canada, family immigration accounts for over a quarter of all immigration. The

8

criteria governing the entitlement to family reunion vary according to the country examined and it is not an automatic right in the case of temporary migration. The EU Commission stresses the importance of family reunification as an important element of integration, finding that the establishment of stable family communities ensures that migrants are able to contribute fully to their new society (EU Commission, 2000). The lesson from other countries is that the scale and impact of family reunion should not be underestimated and needs to be planned for.

LESSON 7 - ILLEGAL IMMIGRATION AND PEOPLE TRAFFICKING REQUIRE A CONCERTED INTERNATIONAL RESPONSE

While data on illegal immigration is by definition difficult to obtain it is estimated that each year there are between twenty and forty million undocumented immigrants worldwide. In the United States, which is regarded as the most desirable destination for immigrants, there are more than five million undocumented immigrants. There is much evidence to suggest that illegal immigrants move around a lot with some just passing through a country and others staying no more than a few months. The OECD also point out that once a flow of emigration to a country starts, it encourages others back at home to join in. These people may wait their turn patiently, but if the pressure or desire to go is strong, they may try their luck at illegal ways of getting into the country, especially if they have family or friends there already.

It is estimated that globally, there are more than 50 organised crime groups engaged in people trafficking activities. According to Immigration News (2001), the price for Chinese passage to the United States was about $50,000 in the year 2000. Profit from human smuggling currently rivals the illegal profits from drug trafficking.   Ruddock (2000) argues that people smuggling involves little risk for the criminal, yet causes significant fiscal and social costs to government and can threaten lives. He says that people smuggling can only be combated effectively by a coherent and coordinated policy that addressees the causes as well as the symptoms. Acting alone, Governments will only succeed in pushing the problem to other parts of the globe.

Intelligence gathering, close co-operation with other countries, and effective legislation must complement physical border controls to combat the growing network of people traffickers.   The lessons from other countries suggest that trafficking in human beings needs a more urgent and concerted response at national, European and international levels.

LESSON 8 - PARTNERSHIP AGREEMENTS WITH SOURCE COUNTRIES MAY HELP ADDRESS MIGRATION IN THE LONG TERM

Taking a long-term global approach to managing migration, it is more beneficial if 'activity' rather than 'people' move. Stemming migration

pressures and managing the flow of migrants needs to take account of trade, the promotion of human rights, development co-operation, crisis intervention and environmental subsidies. The OECD believes that greater market access to developed country markets and openness to foreign direct investment in emigration countries could enhance work opportunities and thereby lower the incentive to move. Regional trade agreements are sometimes advanced as a means to reduce international migration pressures. The OECD point out that foreign aid can also contribute to the development process, especially when it complements domestic policy reforms in the recipient country and provides a conduit for the transmission of technical 'know how'. However, partnership agreements are a long-term strategy as the benefits from more open markets and foreign investment take time to materialise.

9

CONCLUSION - LEADERSHIP AND VISION ARE FUNDAMENTAL
TO SUCCESSFUL MIGRATION MANAGEMENT

The lessons from other countries, such as France and Belgium in particular, highlight the importance of managing migration and showing strong vision and leadership at political and community level. A country's ability to absorb the social and political consequences of immigration is vital. In this regard public attitude plays a large role. The idea that managed migration can be a positive instrument of economic growth has to be cultivated and promoted. Where immigration has never been part of the culture, public resistance could become a real issue. Information campaigns, public debate and strong united political leadership are essential in building positive attitudes to migration. Integration of immigrants particularly in relation to language, education and culture is crucial to the long-term success of migration management and the prevention of racial discrimination.

A balanced migration policy should be humane, transparent and flexible and take responsibility for the long-term welfare of all migrants. The pressing needs of the near term must be balanced against the potential threats of the medium term. Systems need to be flexible enough to attract the type of workers required, facilitate and support genuine asylum seekers, while at the same time ensuring that there are sufficient controls to eliminate people trafficking and to combat illegal immigration. Many commentators point out that migrants are not a threat; it is from the failure to manage migration that the threat arises. A balanced approach to managing migration lies somewhere in the space between generosity and protection of self-interest, both of a country and its citizens.

10

REFERENCES:

Barrett Alan and Trace Fergal (1998), "Who is Coming Back?" The Educational Profile of Returning Migrants in the 1990's. Published in the Irish Banking Review Summer 1998.

Borjas GJ, (2000) Heavens Door. Immigration Policy and the American Economy.

Central Statistics Office (April 2001). Quarterly Household Survey.

Department of Justice Equality and Law Reform Web Site – www.justice.ie

European Parliament (June 2001). Draft Report on the Commission Communication to the Council and the European Parliament on a Community Approach to Immigration.

Eurostat (The European Union's Office of Statistics).

Glover Stephen, Gott Cedri, Lozillon Anais, Portes Jonathan, Price Richard, Spencer Sarah, Srinivsan Vasanthi, Willis Carole. "Migration; an economic and social analysis" RDS Occasional Paper No 67.

Immigration News (2000) Illegal Aliens – A global problem.

Irish Commission for Justice and Peace (1999) – First notes towards a Comprehensive Irish Migration Policy.

OECD, (2000) Trends in International Migration

Ruddcok P (2000) The Public Policy Dimensions of Population – Speech to the Australian Centre of Population Research, 11th October 2000.

UNHCR Statistics 1999: Asylum applications in Ireland.

UN Statistical Commission and Eurostat Joint Working Session on Migration Statistics organised in co-operation with the UN Statistics Division, Geneva May 2001. www.unec.org/stats

Visco Ignacio (2000) Migration Scenarios for the 21st century. Immigration Development and the Labour Market.

Change management in the public sector

Sergeant Jerry Keohane

Jerry Keohane

INTRODUCTION

This short article will present some of the central issues from the change management literature, relate them to public sector management, and refer to An Garda Síochána where appropriate. Only a selection of the central issues will be presented, in particular those which impact on, and best relate to, change management in the public sector. Topics selected include: defining change and change management, the critical leadership role in change, resistance to change, and the incremental change approach.

DEFINITIONS OF CHANGE MANAGEMENT

Organisational change is a vast academic subject area, and many interpretations of what change management entails are evident within the literature. Moss Kanter et al. (1992) notes that :

> *the conventional modern idea of change typically assumes that it involves movement between some discrete and rather fixed states so that organisational change is a matter of being in state 1 at time 1, and state 2 at time 2.*

This particular Moss Kanter definition is relatively fixed and not as dynamic as I feel it should be, within the constraints of necessary stability for organisational success. Unfortunately, other definitions are equally equivocal. Lewin (1951) developed his force field hypothesis with the 'ice-cube' analogy or proposition of change which essentially entailed three steps:

- Unfreezing – reducing those forces which promote maintenance of behaviour in its present form, and creating a recognition of the need for change and improvement to take place,

- Movement – Development of new behaviour patterns and general change implementation.

- Refreezing – Stabilising and consolidating behaviour at the new changed level and reinforcing the desired behaviour through reinforcement, supporting policies etc.

While Lewin's conceptualisation of organisational change is intuitively simple, it may not fully account for the often complex interactions which take place in modern organisations. The 'unfreeze-movement-refreeze' analogy is simplistic and somewhat linear, and in my opinion lacks the breath and depth of coverage necessary to account for the multi-level, complex, concentric, and often emergent change patterns in public sector organisations like An Garda Síochána. In short, human behaviour, with free will, active information processing, expectations, pre-conceived notions etc. is arguably more complex than the Lewin model conceives it to be.

12

THEORETICAL CONCEPTUALISATIONS OF CHANGE

Irrespective of the school of thought one subscribes to, theorists generally agree on variables of three ways in which change can occur; top-down, bottom-up and through shared responsibility:

TABLE 1 : CONCEPTUALISATIONS OF ORGANISATIONAL CHANGE

1 TOP-DOWN:	By decree – senior management issues a directive or instruction By technology – compelled to move with the times By replacement – new appointments to key posts in organisations By structure – regionalism, internationalism or process changes
2 BOTTOM-UP:	By training – to influence attitudes and behaviours By local project groups – improvement schemes, quality circles By leadership initiatives – empowerment and delegation
3 SHARED RESPONSIBILITY:	Through interactive communication Through decision making task forces Through problem solving task forces

Source: adapted from course notes of C. Geaney, Lecturer in Change Management, U.C.D.

These methods of change management may be temporally and geographically specific, since they arguably do not equally apply to all socio-cultural and business environments. The top-down management styles, for instance, have largely been abandoned in favour of more bottom-up and collaborative (or shared responsibility) styles of management which tend to suit the contemporary organic business structures of the private sector, and the Governmental partnership emphasis in both private and public sectors.

In today's Ireland, the partnership approach to national economic recovery, in place since 1987, typifies this orientation towards bottom-up or shared responsibility forms of change management. This ethos has spread throughout the public and private sector. The introduction of a quality service initiative in An Garda Síochána demonstrates this move towards bottom-up/collaborative change management styles. It is also exemplified in the 'bottom-up review group' aspect of the PULSE project and in the implementation of Garda SMI projects.

LEADERSHIP ROLE IN CHANGE PROCESS

Almost all theorists of, and commentators on, change management place significant emphasis on leadership and the communication of a vision throughout the organisation to facilitate successful change management. This is evident in the writings of Deming (1986), Crosby (1979), Juran (1989), and also in the commentary of international authorities on change management including Nadler (1983), Quinn (1980), Anderson, Rungtusanatham and Schroeder (1995), Fechter and Horowitz (1991), Ahire and O'Shaughnessy (1998), and Kotter (1995). Irish commentators including Fynes (1998) and to a lesser extent Drew (1998) have also highlighted the importance of top management/leadership commitment. I consider it to be crucial.

Leadership commitment and example is an integral part of any successful change drive. Ironically this key support structure is often lacking or insufficient. Teal (1998) and others go as far as to suggest that in studying large corporations you discover that the biggest barrier to change, innovation, and new ideas is very often not in middle management but in layers just below the top.

Kotter (1998) distinguishes leadership from management. The latter, according to Kotter, is about coping with complexity, while the former is about coping with change. According to Kotter (1995), transformation efforts most often fail due to leaders not succeeding in one of eight areas. Kotter (1995) proposes eight steps to assist leaders to transform an organisation :

1. *Establishing a sense of urgency*
   This entails initial awareness building of the need for change. This is important preparatory work in that it creates an awareness in organisational stakeholders of the reasons for change, the consequences of not changing, and the time-frame involved.

2. *Forming a powerful guiding coalition*
   This second step entails the creation of a powerful guiding coalition or having a 'sponsor' for the transformation. This person will have the commitment, and personality characteristics necessary to facilitate the change.

3. *Creating a vision*
   A vision is more than a set of goals, it entails a common understanding of the end-product or ideal future state. Unless this vision is commonly understood, change is more difficult to achieve.

4. *Communicating the vision*
   The organisational vision needs to be communicated, according to

13

Kotter, at every possible opportunity, and not just once a year in the annual report or CEO's speech. Furthermore, organisational leaders need to live according to their desired vision.

5. *Empowering others to act on the vision*
This includes removing obstacles to effecting the vision, aligning remuneration and appraisal and generally promoting goal congruence within the organisation.

6. *Planning for and creating short term wins*
This creates a success orientation and facilitates momentum development while simultaneously moderating resistance.

14

7. *Consolidating improvements and producing still more change*
Declaration of ultimate success too early 'kills' momentum, according to Kotter. Change is a slow long-term process, and if this process is expedited it may adversely affect successfulness.

8. *Institutionalising new approaches*
This involves anchoring changes in the corporate culture, and is akin to the 'refreeze' element of Lewin's (1951) three-part 'unfreeze-movement-refreeze' hypothesis. It involves ensuring that successive generations of stakeholders personify the new/desired approach.

Allaire and Firsirotu (1985) reinforce the Kotter (1995) assertions and add that 'no radical strategy will ever occur if the corporation's leadership is not convinced of the need for dramatic actions'. Kilmann (1989) identifies the same essential drivers for change, but unlike Kotter (1995), did not distinguish between managers and leadership. He comments that:

> *Managers … can no longer ignore the need for fundamental system wide changes. Their entire organisations must be transformed into market-driven, innovative, and adaptive systems if they are to survive and prosper in the highly competitive, global environments of the next decades.*
>
> – Kilmann, 1989

A pronounced trend within many contemporary organisations, particularly those with which the author is most familiar, centres on the tendency for senior managers and organisation leaders to delegate their managerial functions. While this may work well in some instances, it may not be generally suitable for managing a large-scale change process. Picking up on this theme vis-à-vis the introduction of a service excellence ethos, Fynes (1998) paraphrasing Flynn et al. 1994, comments that 'the actions and behaviours of senior management with respect to goal-setting, communication, performance measurement/appraisal, and encouraging employee involvement are critical issues in the management of quality'.

Perhaps the greatest single challenge in the area of organisational change relates to overcoming resistance. Resistance can occur due to fear of loss of control on the part of stakeholders or feelings that the initiative is unnecessary. Spiker and Lesser (1995) suggest that planners of organisational change can facilitate their employees in adapting to change (and thereby reduce resistance) by incorporating three elements in their change management strategy. These are; participation, alignment and communication.

Moss Kanter (1992) reiterates this 'gentle' approach suggesting that organisations cannot simply be ordered to change. Moss Kanter proposed that a collaborative or consultative approach to change is the preferred option. She points out that irrespective of one's position within an organisation, even chief executive officers can enunciate new directions, yet fail ultimately to make the difference they intended. Spiker and Lesser (1995) account for this in terms of resistance from key stakeholders, and sometimes sabotage. The initiatives may be, and generally are, appropriate but the management of them is lacking with concomitant results.

This links with the assertion of Quinn (1980) regarding the role of organisation leadership in steering the change process and acting as exemplars for the initiative in their behaviour, thereby reducing ambiguity and moderating resistance. Folger and Skarlicki (1999) identified a heightened awareness of fairness in employees during change periods and clearly management need to take this into account in their behaviours if resistance is to be minimised.

Nadler (1983) also identifies resistance to change as being a significant factor in change management. He points out that people have a need for patterns of stability and that forced change hinders organisational stakeholder's coping mechanisms. Kilmann (1989) does not consider individual resistance to change as a core problematic issue, and takes a holistic view of what he terms 'barriers to change'. This includes organisational cultural barriers, canteen culture, etc. It is fair to suggest, however, that the canteen culture best flourishes when formal communication channels are not fully open or utilised.

Irrespective of the view of an organisation one holds, however, humans tend to be rational in their approach, and this applies to change also, in the author's opinion. Accordingly, incentivising a change initiative should make the transition easier to achieve. Accepting that people respond to both intrinsic and extrinsic motivators, Nadler (1983) points out that:

rewards such as bonuses, pay systems, promotion, recognition, job assignment, and status symbols all need to be carefully examined during

major organisational changes and restructured to support the direction of the transition.

In Nadler's view, intrinsic rewards include all those incentives or motivators which can be tangible or intangible but which appeal to the individual person including praise, recognition, feedback, allocated parking etc. The extrinsic motivators tend to be more tangible and financial including; salary, share options, bonuses, etc.

INCREMENTAL CHANGE

16

Quinn (1980), Kilmann (1989), and later Reger, Gustafson, Demarie, and Mullane (1994), amongst others, advocate the implementation of change in a phased incremental manner. Kilmann's five-track approach underscores the need to ensure that goals are achieved in each area before moving to the next. In terms of an appropriate time-frame, Kilmann suggests that five years or more could be necessary for a large, older, organisation that must transform itself in almost every way.

The time which is required for large-scale change to fully materialise is overlooked in many change initiatives. Kilmann emphasises monitoring change as it actually occurs and ensuring that the final end-product is also evaluated to ensure that goals have been achieved. The Kilmann approach seems to be well fitted to a major change initiative in a very large organisation like An Garda Síochána, where the scale of the change is likely to consume significant resources and time.

James Brian Quinn (1980) formulates a theory of logical incremental change. His hypothesis entails preliminary analysis, including consultation with all stakeholders internal and external, to select a small number of the alternative starting points uncovered. As such, it appears to be intuitively sensible and well considered. The strategy advocates a serial procedure, and incorporates crucial organisational and behavioural factors into the process of strategy formulation. Quinn identifies 14 factors which are critical to the success of any change initiative. Some of these have been considered earlier in this paper:

1. Senior management commitment – generally agreed by all theorists
2. Existence of slack resources – without which change is difficult to achieve
3. Resources which match the size and kind of change - necessary effort expended
4. Political support - includes having a sponsor, adopting culture etc.
5. Change starting at top management - in both actions and words
6. Building on platforms already in place - starting with accepted good points
7. Creating awareness and commitment - full initial communication
8. Amplification of understanding and awareness - full training is critical

9. Building credibility - following up on commitments made
10. Legitimising new viewpoints - Reinforcing new/desired behaviour
11. Facilitation of tactical shifts and partial solutions - interim wins promote momentum
12. Broadening of political support - connectionist networks throughout the organisation
13. Structured flexibility - flexibility as necessary
14. Systematic waiting - waiting may be better on occasions than to proceed

Quinn's approach is cautious also in that he suggests that organisation leaders initially post ideas to the organisation without, as he says, 'being too wedded to its details'. This is akin to the U.S. idiom of 'flying it (an idea/suggestion) up the flag-pole to see who will salute it'. Quinn suggests that this process permits stakeholders to criticise and comment in a safe environment. For management, it avoids the provision of a target for what will otherwise be fragmented opposition. Once the initial analysis is complete, Quinn proposes some practical approaches for effective maintenance of the change process as follows:

- Begin with a success - to start on a positive note
- Provide early reinforcements - to cultivate commitment
- Create pockets of commitment - which should spread an ethos through the organisation
- Focus the organisation - with goals etc.
- Manage coalitions - include all stakeholders, representative groups etc.
- Formalise commitment by empowering champions - empowerment gives ownership
- Ensure the process is continuous and dynamic - avoid stagnation and loss of momentum
- Build commitment and erode consensus - facilitate goal congruence
- Continually reassess the organisation vis-à-vis the surrounding environment - holistically
- Articulate a shared vision - develop a clear mission and vision which everyone recognises
- Ensure standards, measures and feedback mechanisms - following Crosby's mantra that 'what gets measured gets done'

CHANGE MANAGEMENT LESSONS FOR POLICING
It is generally accepted that a successful change programme requires strong leadership, a clearly communicated sequence of events and a swift break from the past. (Strebel, 1996, Duck, 1993, Kanter et al., 1992, Kanter, 1983). Findings by Kotter 1995, Kanter, 1992 and Beer 1990 stipulate seven recommendations for successful change programmes *(Figure 1).*

17

FIGURE 1: SEVEN CHANGE PROGRAMME RECOMMENDATIONS

1. INSTITUTION-ALISE CHANGE THROUGH A SHARED MINDSET	2. DISASSOCIATE CHANGE FROM PAST EFFORTS	3. DEVELOP A DESIRE FOR CHANGE	4. DEVELOP CHANGE LEADERS	5. ALIGN SUPPORT AND REWARD SYSTEMS WITH CHANGE	6. COMMUNICATE CHANGE CLEARLY	CHANGE WITH CONSISTENCY

The ambitious change programme embarked upon by the New Zealand police did not capture the imagination and support of those most affected – front-line officers. If change agents fail to align the vision with the culture in a consistent manner through communication and leadership a change programme will be perceived as contradictory to the needs of an organisation – regardless of whether it is in the public or private sector. Without a shared desire for change at individual and organisational level the individual perception that change will fail will override all positive aspects of a change programme and failure will emerge as a self-fulfilling prophecy. Because of communication misperceptions the NZ change programme was plagued by ongoing delays and problems (particularly technological) that resulted in a crisis in policing that included staff shortages attributed to stress and programme associated changes. When the issue came into the public arena the programme was shelved, and many change agents including the Commissioner of Police resigned.

SUMMARY

A review of the literature shows that there are a number of major themes in common between the current theorists on the management and implementation of large-scale organisational change. The fact that there are also divergences suggests that, before embarking on large-scale change, an organisation should develop plans, implementation methods and approaches which are tailored to the organisation. One evident gap in the literature, in the author's view, is that there appears to be a paucity of academic research vis-à-vis the implementation of change or change management within the public sector. This is relevant in the context of this paper.

A common trend evident within the academic commentators centres on the role of senior management or organisational leaders. Without a clear commitment from top management in both words and actions, a commitment that cannot be delegated effectively, change initiatives are less likely to succeed. Similarly, change initiatives which are driven from within the organisation and involve all stakeholders are generally more successful.

An important point is that change should be envisaged as a continuous cyclical activity rather than something that has a fixed term. Change is a continuous and on-going process, and this is particularly true of change associated with quality improvements. This is evidenced by the

developmental evolution of computers, cars, foods, consumer goods etc. In the service sector also, there is no absolute level of service, which can be attained with concomitant implications for future progression. Change is constant, dynamic, complex, multi-faceted, and reactionary, and must be managed accordingly.

19

REFERENCES

Ahire, S. L. and O'Shaughnessy, K. C. (1998) 'The Role of Top Management Commitment in Quality Management:an Empirical Analysis of the Auto Parts Industry', International Journal of Quality Science, Vol. 3, No. 1,pp 5-37.

Allaire, Y. and Firsirotu, M. (1985) 'How to Implement Radical Strategies in Large Organisations', Sloan Management Review, Spring 1985

Anderson, J. C., Rungtusanatham, M., and Schroeder, R. G. (1995) 'A Path Analytic Model of a Theory of Quality Management Underlying the Deming Management Method : Preliminary Empirical Findings', Decision Sciences, Vol. 26, No. 5, pp 637-658.

Crosby, P.B. (1979) *Quality is Free,* New American Library, New York.

Deming, W, E. (1986) *Out of the Crisis,* MIT Centre for Advanced Engineering, Cambridge, MA.

Drew, E. (1998) 'In Pursuit of Excellence: Total Quality Approaches in Irish Organisations', *The TQM Magazine,* Vol. 10, Issue 6.

Fechter, W.F., and Horowitz, R.B. (1991) 'Visionary Leadership Needed by All Managers', *Industrial Management,* Norcross July/August 1991

Folger, R., and Skarlicki, D.P. (1999) 'Unfairness and Resistance to Change: Hardship as Mistreatment', *Journal of Organisational Change Management,* Vol. 12, No.1, pp. 35-50.

Fynes, B. (1998) 'Quality Management Practices : A Review of the Literature', *IBAR-Irish Business and Administrative Research Publication,* Issue 19/20, Vol. 2.

Juran, J.M. (1989) 'Universal Approach to Managing for Quality', *Executive Excellence,* Vol. 6, No. 5.

Kilmann, R. (1989) 'A Completely Integrated Programme for Creating and Maintaining Organisational Success', in *Organizational Dynamics,* adapted from 'Managing Beyond the Quick Fix', Jossey Bass, New York.

Kotter, J. P. (1995) 'Leading Change: Why Transformation Efforts Fail', *Harvard Business Review on Change,* Harvard Business School Press, Boston, MA.

Kotter, J. P. (1998) 'What Leaders Really Do', *Harvard Business Review on Change,* Harvard Business School Press, Boston, MA.

Lewin, K. (1951) *Field Theory in Social Science,* Harper and Row, New York.

Moss Kanter, R., Stein, B. A., and Jick, T. D. (1992) *The Challenge of Organizational Change,* The Free Press, New York.

Nadler, D. (1983) Concepts for the Management of Organisational Change', *Delta Consulting Group.*

Quinn, J. B. (1980) 'Managing Strategic Change', *Sloan Management Review,* Summer Vol. 21 No. 4 pp 3-20

Reger, R.K., Gustafson, L.T., Demarie, S., Mullane, J. (1994) 'Reframing the Organisation: Why Implementing Total Quality is easier said than done', *Academy of Management Review,* Vol. 19, No.3, pp 565-584.

Spiker, B.K., and Lesser, E. (1995) 'We Have Met The Enemy' *The Journal of Business Strategy,* Boston, March/April 1995.

Teal, T. (1998) *The Human Side of Management,* Harvard Business Review on Leadership, Harvard Business School Press, Boston, MA.

Garda MA Students
at John Jay College of Criminal Justice, New York

Garda Patricia Gill and Sergeant David Kavanagh

Patricia Gill

David Kavanagh

20

FOREWORD

*S*tudying in New York with the McCabe Fellowship Scholarship made a millennium year to remember for two members of An Garda Síochána. They were given the opportunity to pursue Masters Degree programmes in John Jay College of Criminal Justice, New York as part of the McCabe Fellowship Exchange Programme. The opportunity of studying at John Jay College, with the exciting panorama of New York City as its campus, gave the McCabe Scholars the opportunity to experience the best that the "Big Apple" had to offer – and the best included the number one criminal justice college in the US. Working with the New York Police Department, together with the pride of representing An Garda Síochána at an international level, and honouring the memory of Detective Garda Jerry McCabe were opportunities afforded to Sergeant David Kavanagh and Garda Patricia Gill. After an open and keen competition for the prized places, an MA degree programme had to be completed in New York, and David Kavanagh graduated with a Masters Degree in Criminal Justice and Patricia Gill completed a Masters in Forensic Psychology. Both are now key members of the Garda Organisation Development Unit, producing excellent work. Sergeant Orla McPartlin, the Garda EU Co-ordinator, was a previous McCabe fellow who produced an extremely important body of work since she graduated four years ago.

STUDY AT JOHN JAY COLLEGE, STUDY IN NEW YORK, STUDY WITH NYPD, STUDY…

The Masters courses we completed involved tough, tight, college semesters where the quality of class participation was an essential element and where the depth and width of literature reviewed provided a wonderful knowledge base. This opportunity to complete studies was a wonderful facility offered to the McCabe Fellowship by John Jay College. The work included attendance at lectures, class presentations, mid-term and final examinations, practical work and written assignments, as well as an externship in the forensic psychology course. It was an extremely busy time, needing steady heads, strong commitment, planning and the willingness to put in long hours of intense study.

"New York, New York" banners proclaimed New York to be the "Millennium Capital of the World". We took more than the bite of education from "The Big Apple" as New York City has plenty to offer with five boroughs, 150 museums, 18,000 restaurants and countless world famous attractions. These attractions include Ellis Island, the Statute of Liberty, Times Square, the theatre district, and the famous Central Park. We were also fortunate and delighted to have been invited to many gala social occasions during our time there, including the Police Foundation Ball at One Police Plaza(1PP), the Flax Trust Ball at the Waldorf Astoria, and of course the McCabe Breakfast at John Jay College on March 16th 2001.

Because of its reputation for criminal justice, first in the US, John Jay College fosters close links with law enforcement agencies all over the world, particularly the New York Police Department. We had a number of "official" visits to police precincts, including Police Headquarters at 1PP (One Police Plaza), and correctional facilities. John Jay College maintains a strong association with the NYPD and runs various courses for their members, such as training programmes to manage situations involving mentally disturbed persons, HIDTA course, (High Intensity Drug Trafficking Area), and interviewing and interrogative techniques. NYPD members, often with strong Irish connections, were particularly helpful to the McCabe Scholars and offered a number of "ride-alongs" in each New York borough. The Narcotics Unit in Brooklyn, the Harbour Unit and the Psychological Services Section were particularly helpful to us. Other highlights were attending an anti-terrorist briefing for security managers in New York City, a visit to the offices of the Organisation Management and Planning (OMAP) unit of the NYPD to meet Inspector John Gerrish (one of the first NYPD participants in the McCabe Exchange Programme), and a session of Compstat, their crime-mapping crime-fighting computer and command system. A visit to the office of the New York City Police Foundation proved to be very interesting and provided us with important information on the operation of a foundation and how it acts as a go-between for corporate sponsors and the NYPD. The New Jersey State Police participated in the McCabe Programme for the first time in 2000 when Major Joe Brennan reviewed the procedures used by An Garda Síochána for dealing with persons in custody, and internal investigations. Major Brennan arranged visits for us to the New Jersey State Police academy in Sea Girt, and the State Police Headquarters in Trenton, where we saw at first hand the important work of the Office of Professional Development.

21

JOHN JAY COLLEGE OF CRIMINAL JUSTICE

John Jay College of Criminal Justice, situated in mid-town Manhattan is one of the only colleges in the United States that is exclusively dedicated to education, research and service in the fields of criminal justice and public service. It has a global reputation as the leading college in criminal justice and research in the US. The graduate programmes at the college, including Criminal Justice, Forensic Science, Forensic Psychology and Public Administration are taught by an internationally recognised faculty who often refer to their own research to make classes topical and current. The college is affiliated to the "City University of New York" (CUNY) as a liberal arts college. The "Lloyd George Sealy Library" at the college has research materials that are extensive and readily available, and contains a comprehensive criminal justice collection and holds more than 275,000 books, periodicals and microfilms, CD-ROM and internet sources, all providing the college student with a superior level of academic support when it comes to study. The college has been developed into the number one US criminal justice college by Dr. Gerald Lynch, President of the

COMPETITION, CULTURE, CHANGE

> *"Southwest has proliferated competitive advantages throughout its value chain, including an exceptionally motivated workforce. Kelleher's commitment to the rank and file and his determination to ask questions, provide answers, and use every viable means to demonstrate the importance of employees has unleashed exceptional loyalty, extra effort, team spirit, and productivity that is the hallmark and a powerful asset of Southwest. Put simply, the companywide will to win fuels Southwest's success".* – Mark Stevens.

A strong current of competitive culture gives organisations a corridor of opportunity. Greater, faster growth achieves a sustainable competitive advantage. Harvard Professor Michael Porter's research recommends a strong differentiation strategy or low-cost production with clear choices in strategy. Southwest Airlines – which achieves low cost and low fares by sacrificing meals, assigned seats, and other amenities – is a good example. While the financial performance of Southwest's competitors is rocked by the airline industry's rises and dips, Southwest reports an unbroken streak of profits. Southwest makes it look easy. United set out to beat Southwest, identifying three key components to Southwest's formula for success:

1. Using only Boeing 737s, Southwest reduced maintenance, parts, and fuel costs.
2. A point-to-point route map, not hub-and-spoke reduced crew and simplified logistics.
3. Secondary airports reduced airport charges and time between takeoffs and landings.

It was an apparently easy formula for United to replicate but the venture collapsed amidst massive losses of $500 million. United's postmortem revealed the causes of this fiasco. The airline's due diligence had failed to identify the invisible factor that propelled Southwest from a fledgling carrier to a competitive juggernaut. By focusing on related activities, and building a team infused with a powerful esprit de corps, Southwest CEO Herb Kelleher had created a dynamic synergy among employees, technology, and systems. United's turnaround time to land a plane, discharge passengers, and take flight once again never broke the thirty-minute barrier. Yet Southwest – servicing the same planes at the same airports with the same number in its maintenance crew – routinely accomplishes this fundamental airline routine in less than half that time. And so Southwest, as Ryanair does in Europe, reigns as the airline industry's lowfare leader. Why?

HUMAN RESOURCES, QUALITY, MANAGING CHANGE

Southwest has proliferated competitive advantages throughout its value chain, including an exceptionally motivated workforce. Kelleher's commitment to the rank and file and his determination to ask questions, provide answers, and use every viable means to demonstrate the importance of employees has unleashed exceptional loyalty, extra effort, team spirit, and productivity that is the hallmark and a powerful asset of Southwest. Put simply, the companywide will to win fuels Southwest's success. A fifteen-minute disparity in airplane turnaround time may seem inconsequential, but multiply that advantage by hundreds of turnarounds at scores of airports daily, and it means Southwest flies more flights with less equipment, thereby collecting more revenue.

Rectifying as many as twenty to thirty small quality of management issues can add up to as much as a 20 per cent improvement. Organisations seeking change must drive goals, competence, motivation, resources, action plan, and follow up to deliver real change. Kontura International uses the following template to rate the success or failure of a change process. If any element is missing **(X is the missing element)** the following results:

THE SUCCESS OR FAILURE OF A CHANGE PROCESS

Visions/goals	Competence	Motivation	Resource	Action plan	Follow up	= Real change
X	Competence	Motivation	Resources	Action plan	Follow up	= Confusion
Visions/goals	X	Motivation	Resources	Action plan	Follow up	= Uncertainty
Visionsl/goals	Competence	X	Resources	Action plan	Follow up	= No driving force
Visions/goals	Competence	Motivation	X	Action plan	Follow up	= Frustration
Visions/goals	Competence	Motivation	Resources	X	Follow up	= Trial and error
Visions/goals	Competence	Motivation	Resources	Action plan	X	= What have we done, learned?

Managing Migration

Strong medicine for Garda missions

Change Management

Photos by Garda Photographic Section

P O I N T

Ethel Truly, Mississippi Chemical's vice president describes her experience,

"I have always recognized the important role people play in a company, but I had never identified the fact that an intelligent and integrated human resources strategy is the only sustainable competitive advantage. Every other corporate asset can be bought or replicated virtually overnight, but competitors seeking to duplicate a well-trained, motivated, and committed workforce will need at least a decade to catch up. Exceptional cultures just can't be created with the wave of a wand – or a major infusion of capital. Creating a workforce with a strong work ethic and a history of tech-nical innovation will provide competitive advantage but it must be

- *Innovative in every aspect of our business;*
- *Customer-oriented;*
- *Adaptable to changes in markets, strategy, procedures, equipment and other work tools.*

Two major programs were implemented from a management evaluation on the strengths and weaknesses of our workforce and the gap between where we felt our workforce was and where it needed to be."

MISSISSIPPI CHEMICAL MANAGEMENT TRAINING/SUPPORT AND PERSONAL DEVELOPMENT PROGRAMME

Ethel Truly describes their Management Training and Support: "We had never done a good job of supporting people we'd promoted to managerial posts. Instead, we would take the best people from the operating ranks and put them in supervisory positions, even though they had little or no experience, and possibly no skill, in managing others. In effect, we promoted them based on abilities that were not relevant to their new positions and then let them sink or swim on their own. No longer. Now, we are providing training on: thinking strategically, establishing priorities, giving and receiving feedback, developing communication skills, conducting effective personal interviews, conflict resolution, understanding the full scope of company strategy, policies, and procedures (once the training began, we discovered how much of this is often a mystery to people), the use of computers, digital equipment, and other tools, including for people who might have considered themselves nonusers. We have created a centralised training function, hired a training manager for the first time, and devoted substantially more resources to education of all kinds"…

…and their Personal Development Programme: "Evaluating employees has always been a part of our standard operating procedure. In typical fashion, the evaluations focused on an employee's performance to date (usually very recent performance) with a report card approach. We think we've adopted a better system by linking an employee's evaluation to a series of personal development options. First, we subject employees to a 360 degree evaluation – meaning we get appraisals from peers, superiors, subordinates, and customers. The system forces narrative feedback, comments on those workforce 'gap characteristics' identified by senior management, and specific examples."

"Then, we produce an assessment of strengths and weaknesses for the employee. Soon afterward, the employee and his supervisor select between one and three areas of development to make the person a more effective and productive member of the workforce. We have people trained to assist the employee and supervisor in creating a written development plan with a schedule. Development tools may include such traditional learning methods as attending seminars and reading helpful materials, but the emphasis is on growth on the job. A development .plan might include, for example, participating in a company activity that will allow strengthening of particular skills, leading a project team, working in a different area of the companyion some basis, or even service in a community group in a capacity that will provide the experience sought. Instead of handing out report cards, we offer tools that can serve as springboards to personal improvement, career success, and a workforce that has the skills we believe to be essential for the company's competitiveness."

"Once these efforts were well under way, our CEO concluded that, if our strategy was to evolve effectively and intelligently on a timely basis, senior managers needed more time away from the front lines to think, contemplate, and, plan. From this insight came a requirement that the senior staff spend four days a month away from the office in individual reading, planning, and reflection in a nearby site."

I have reproduced this extract in full because it holds such a powerful lesson for us. We have produced a very revealing climate survey and a number of key research reports which illuminate the route to an intelligent integrated human resources strategy.   We have a lot of hard work ahead of us. But we are well on the way. Much has already been done.

Peter Fitzgerald, Editor

John Jay College

One-man Garda Stations

College, one of the founder members of the McCabe Fellowship and a member of the Patten Commission. He is a regular visitor to Ireland, and to An Garda Síochána, and he has had an influential role in improving policing in many parts of the world.

24

MASTER OF ARTS IN FORENSIC PSYCHOLOGY

The term "forensic" is generally used to refer to psychologists who work with offenders, and their victims. More generally, forensic psychology is concerned with the application of psychological principles within the judicial system, as it explores the interface between criminal justice and psychology. The programme at John Jay College examines what goes on in the criminal mind and what is the "psychology" of the victim. The course aims to train graduates to apply psychological insights, concepts and skills to the understanding and functioning of the legal and criminal justice systems. John Jay College is one of the few colleges in the United States that offers a Masters of Arts programme in Forensic Psychology. Applicants are expected to have a strong undergraduate background in psychology, as there are competitive admission procedures. The forensic psychology programme involves research and practice in elements including:

FIGURE 1 FIVE ELEMENTS OF FORENSIC PSYCHOLOGY COURSE

The course places an emphasis on the practical application of psychological theory in a forensic environment. Students are also given an insight into how psychological enquiry relates to legal decision making. The John Jay College Master of Arts in Forensic Psychology programme is a 39-credit course (with 3 credits awarded per subject), which includes 36 credits of course work (12 subjects) with the additional 3 credits for an externship of 400 hours or a thesis. The externship, a work placement of 400 hours, is opted for by most students. There are seven mandatory or "required" courses in the forensic psychology programme, and the other five are "electives", chosen by the student.

TABLE 1 REQUIRED AND ELECTIVE COURSES

REQUIRED COURSES	ELECTIVE COURSES	
• Research Design and methods	• Psychology of criminal behaviour	• Ethical Issues in forensic psychology
• Advanced psychology of personality	• Psychological profiling of homicidal offenders	• Psychology and treatment of the juvenile offender
• Psychopathology	• Key concepts of psychotherapy	• Social psychology and the legal system
• Personality Assessment I	• Psychology of policing	• Deviant Behaviour
• Personality Assessment II	• Psychology of the victim	• Urban Anthropology
• Psychology and Law	• Developmental psychology	• Group dynamics and group treatment
• Clinical Interviewing	• Social aspects of alcohol and drug use	• Violence and aggression • Social psychopathology

25

REQUIRED COURSES

The required courses in John Jay College focus on the use of psychology in the criminal justice system. The *Psychology and Law* class focused on the application of psychological knowledge and concepts to legal issues such as legal competencies, mental state at the time of the offence, the prediction of future dangerousness, theories and effects of sentencing policies. *Research Design and Methods* helped the student to examine the nature of the research process and provided guidelines for formulating researchable questions and testable hypothesis. Once the student was familiar with the various theoretical, historical and clinical considerations in understanding the etiology, diagnosis and treatment of abnormal behaviour, *Psychopathology* placed an emphasis on current approaches to the diagnosis and treatment of psychopathology. *The Personality Assessment* classes focused on the administration, scoring and interpretation of personality tests including the MMPI (Minnesota Multiphasic Personality Inventory) and the Rorsharch Inkblot test. Both tests are used in the USA to assist with clinical and forensic assessments. The *Advanced Psychology of Personality* course examined theories of personality from a primarily psychodymanic point of view and looked at the practical implications of various theories in areas of pathological development. *Clinical Interviewing* centered on the clinical interview as a means of gathering data and evaluating the "client", and placed a particular emphasis on methods that deal with defensive interviewing, commonly used by criminals.

ELECTIVE COURSES

We were facilitated in choosing our particular areas of interest when it came to choosing elective subjects. One of the more interesting elective courses was Psychological Profiles of Homicidal Offenders which involved the investigative aspects of forensic work, including work on crime detection and offender profiling. The course involved the

26

presentation of various psychological profiles, different levels of motivation and different prognoses of homicide.   Students were instructed on the psychological evidence of the offender that can be gained from assessment of the crime scene. Crime scenes that are organised or disorganized in appearance can actually give the police an insight into the personality of the offender.

Psychology of Criminal Behaviour examined theories of crime, psychological assessment of criminal behaviour, psychopathy, and current issues and concerns in the assessment of dangerousness. Risk assessment tools and methods were explained in order to estimate recidivism rates. The issue of assessment of "malingering" was also concentrated upon, for criminals that might be faking mental illness. Psychology has much to contribute to the understanding of police officers and the way in which they function as much of the empirical research shows. The *Psychology of Policing* course focused on the use of psychological principles and research to gain an in-depth understanding of important topics within the field of policing including the personality of police officers, police stress, police suicide and psychological treatment techniques for police officers that have been exposed to traumatic incidents. Finally, *Concepts of Psychotherapy* focused on the application of therapeutic techniques for the treatment of various psychological disorders, including post-traumatic stress disorder.

EXTERNSHIP AT THE CITY OF NEW YORK POLICE DEPARTMENT PSYCHOLOGICAL SERVICES UNIT

In addition to classes, the externship involved a 400-hour work placement at the psychological services unit of the City of New York police Department. The Department of Personnel of the City of New York Police Department contains a Medical Division, under which the Psychological Services section operates.   The Psychological Services Section is made up of a psychological evaluation unit and a candidate-testing unit.   Duties included observation of fitness for duty evaluations for police officers, and administrative duties concerned with the cases that are referred to the unit. Participation in reviews and discussions of case material and research (i.e. in the area of post-traumatic stress disorder) was also a feature of the placement.

PSYCHOLOGICAL EVALUATIONS

The psychological evaluation unit is specifically concerned with evaluations of psychological fitness for full duty of police officers. The purpose of fitness for duty evaluations is to evaluate the fitness of the member of the NYPD for full duty, from a psychological perspective. This includes the assessment of any psychological problems of the officer that could interfere with full duty with a firearm, and assesses whether it is appropriate for him/her to carry a firearm. Evaluations are particularly

important because of the issue of firearms, and once evaluated, the psychologists at the unit can place a "psychological hold" on police officers' weapons. The psychological evaluation differs from other psychological evaluation centres in that the "client" is actually the police department, and it's role is to advise the police department on the psychological suitability of its members for duty. A high proportion of the cases that are referred to the unit are mandated to attend for a fitness for duty evaluation. The unit does not perform treatment or therapy for individuals that are referred, but can make recommendations for the person involved to seek therapy/treatment outside the department. The question of whether the officer is able to perform "full" duties as a police officer must also be considered. An officer may be placed on administrative duties on a temporary basis. If it arises that he/she will never have the psychological ability to carry a firearm again, a report is prepared by the Director, recommending that the officer is pensioned off the job.

27

CANDIDATE-TESTING UNIT

The candidate-testing unit involves selection and testing of applicants for the City of New York Police Department, including school safety officers, police officers, and 911 operators. Psychological tests that are administered to candidates include the California Psychological Inventory (CPI), Cornell Index (CI), the "draw a picture" test, and the Minnesota Multiphasic Personality Inventory (MMPI). It was interesting to gain an insight into using the CPI and the Cornell Index, and projective drawing, (house, tree and person) which was explained and interpreted by the Clinical Director at the unit. Interviews of candidates include information on interpersonal relations and skills (i.e. family of origin information, peer relations and marital status) as well as a history of functioning (i.e. general psychological health, thought processes, judgment, affect and impulse control). The mental status of the candidate is observed, together with reality testing. Physical status must also be taken into consideration in evaluations, including alcohol/drug use.

TRAUMA DEBRIEFINGS

When a member of the service has been involved in a critical incident, the psychological evaluation unit offers trauma debriefing. A critical incident is defined as anything that exceeds the individual's capacity to cope, and is defined not in terms of the event but rather the *impact* that it has on the individual, i.e. hostage situation or accident. In critical incidents that involve a shooting, where the officer or perpetrator is injured, the officer is mandated to attend a debriefing session.

The psychological evaluation unit provided excellent experience in areas that included observation, interviewing, discussions, psychological evaluations, trauma debriefings and administrative duties. The work at

the unit also allowed the incorporation of previous academic coursework (psychopathology, clinical interviewing, personality assessment, etc.) into practical experience. The unit was completely different from what I expected, and was by no means a "regular" evaluation unit, which made it particularly interesting. The important skill of detecting those who are feigning illness is certainly an asset when conducting psychological evaluations. The unit were also particularly helpful in allowing attendance at all of the referrals, as well as allowing the flexibility to liaise with other sections of the NYPD, i.e. the Medical Division, the Employee Management Division, the Counseling Unit (where alcohol evaluations take place) and the candidate testing unit.

28

THE MASTER OF ARTS DEGREE IN CRIMINAL JUSTICE

The Master of Arts Degree in Criminal Justice comprises core and elective subjects. The core subjects are designed to provide the student with the skills to understand current issues in the criminal justice system, analyse policy issues, and design and conduct research projects. The elective subjects allow students to pursue studies in specialised areas that most interest them or are most appropriate to their present occupations. There is a wide range of specialisations offered. They include criminology and deviance; criminal law and procedure; study of drug and alcohol abuse; and juvenile justice. Sergeant Kavanagh opted for the police administration specialisation.

The classes ranged in size from 60 persons for a core subject to as low as 8 in some elective classes. The backgrounds of the course participants were varied. About 30 per cent of each class were law enforcement personnel. The remainder of classes comprised either young graduates who intended to pursue a career in local, state or federal law enforcement and were taking the Master's programme to enhance their employment prospects, or mature students employed in parallel fields such as public agencies, insurance companies and the law. In addition to the varied occupations of the students there was, as could be expected in a city such as New York, a wide mix of ethnic and cultural backgrounds in each class. Students came from all parts of New York, the United States and other countries such as Turkey, Cyprus, Japan, Estonia, Germany, Liberia, and of course Ireland. The mix of students ensured there were always lively debates in the classrooms. The Socratic teaching method is employed to ensure a high degree of student participation. This method ensures that students come to class prepared to debate the issues with the professor and classmates. It also ensures that students keep up to date with the required readings as the quality of class participation can account for up to 25 per cent of a course grade!

TABLE 2 CORE AND ELECTIVE COURSES OF THE MA IN
CRIMINAL JUSTICE (POLICE ADMIN MAJOR)

CORE COURSES	ELECTIVE COURSES
Issues in Criminal Justice I	Police Ethics
Issues in Criminal Justice II	Investigative Techniques
Research Design and Methods	Police Leadership
Computers in Social Research	Crime, the Media and Criminal Justice
Policy Analysis in Criminal Justice	Institutions
	Computer Applications in Public Policy and
	Management
	Comprehensive Review

Issues in Criminal Justice is taught in two modules. An interesting
feature of this course is the fact that it is a team-taught subject. In each
session two professors presented complementary information on the topic
from different viewpoints. The first module analysed the American
Criminal Justice system from both legal and sociological perspectives.
One of the professors was a lawyer, while the other was a sociologist. A
number of key areas of the criminal justice system were examined, they
included the distinction between criminal law and criminal procedure,
the concept of criminal responsibility, how society determines which
behaviours to criminalise, the social causes of crime, and how policing
and punishment impacts both the offender and the community. The aim
of this course was to critically examine the relationships between legal and
sociological perspectives, asking whether the law's focus on individual
guilt and concrete controversies can be fruitfully integrated with a
sociological understanding of the broader social contexts within which
crime occurs.

The second module had a focus on police and corrections (prisons)
personnel. This module familiarised the student with theories, themes,
and significant research in these areas. The main topics were subculture,
discretion, multiculturalism, community policing, community
corrections, and organisation and management of police/corrections
agencies. The desired outcome of the module was to provide students
with some analytical and critical skills in the fields of police and
corrections research.

RESEARCH DESIGN AND METHODS
The Research Design and Methods course was an important pillar of the
Master's programme, introducing the graduate student to the major
methods of gathering, analysing, and presenting social science data. The
primary goal of the course was to provide the student with the basic skills
for designing and executing original research, as well as critically
evaluating and utilising the findings of existing studies in the field of
criminal justice. The professor for this course has wide experience in
conducting ethnographic studies of the links between substance abuse –

29

alcohol and drugs – and crime. The Computers in Social Research course complements the Design and Methods course. The course develops the student's skill in using computers for analysing social science data. Students learned how to code and input data, do statistical analyses, interpret statistical analyses, and write results accurately. This was a practical class which was conducted in the Law and Police Science Computer Laboratory which is a state-of-the-art facility in the college. The main software used for the course was SPSS (Statistical Product and Service Solutions)-PC for Windows (version 10.0), the same software used by the Organisation Development Unit.

30

The final core subject was Policy Analysis in Criminal Justice. The course explored contemporary public policy issues with respect to crime and the criminal justice system. The course examined the goals, objectives, planning, implementation, and outcomes of current criminal justice policies. Emphasis was placed on critical exploration of the impacts of the political, social, and economic contexts of crime, the criminal justice system and criminal justice policy making. The student's capacities as a policy analyst were enhanced by participating in class discussion, and delivering oral and written presentations of policy evaluations.

The first of the elective courses taken was Police Ethics. The course was taught by Professor John Kleinig, a celebrated author of many books and journal articles on the topic. His book "The Ethics of Policing" is used at the Garda College and it formed part of the content of the course in John Jay. The course focused on the ethical dimensions of police work. Two approaches were apparent. For citizens as recipients of police services, the course allowed them to pose questions about the ethical quality of the police service they experience. For police officers or law enforcement officials the course was designed to help them develop a professional ethic. The course covered the basic nature of police ethics, the concept of the blue wall of silence which is so apparent in cases of police corruption/deviance, investigative deception, use of force issues, policing diversity and perhaps most importantly in the context of ethics, the use of discretion by police officers.

An allied topic was taken for the second elective – Investigative Techniques. The title of the course is a slight misnomer as the course does not examine crime investigation rather it focuses on the various methods and strategies that are used to investigate corruption and fraud in the public sector. Particular emphasis was placed on the theoretical perspectives that inform law enforcement officials, Inspectors General and policy makers. The investigative techniques and methods were outlined through a combination of case studies and lectures by guest speakers. Perhaps the most interesting guest speaker from a police perspective was the Chief of the Internal Affairs Bureau of the NYPD.

His two-hour presentation gave a comprehensive overview of how the department has learned from its past mistakes and implemented a thorough mechanism for preventing corruption in the first instance, and investigating and prosecuting deviant officers when corruption does occur.

The only elective class which was made up exclusively of police or law enforcement personnel was the Police Leadership course. The course explored and developed a conceptual framework for modern police leadership. The emphasised focus was on the complexity of the leadership process in law enforcement organisations, from the perspective of individual officers, social and work groups. The background to the course was the inevitable change in the environment in which the police operate. Leadership styles will have to change to meet the challenges and requirements of a culturally diverse society and workforce. The goal of the course was to analyse the concepts of leadership, as they represent a step beyond management. Key concepts were analysed and they included organisational and individual development, the dimensions and dynamics of police groups, communication and counselling skills, ethical considerations, and the adaptation of leadership processes to a changing society.

A valuable perspective on policing was gained through the elective subject entitled "Crime, the Media, and Criminal Justice Institutions". This course examined the interaction between the media and criminal justice institutions, and the way this interaction affects the public's perception of crime and the justice system. The course covered the historical, social and cultural perspectives of the issue. Some of the interesting aspects of the course were the examination of why and how the media cover crime issues; how criminal justice agencies create their own images; the effects of "reality television" on public perceptions; the media and the fear of crime; and the love/hate relationship between the police and the media.

The Computer Applications in Public Policy and Management course focused on the use of computers as tools in the management of public service organisations. The emphasis was very much on applications in various aspects of management – policy making, decision making, project management, and operations. The impact of information technology on individuals, organisations and society, and the concomitant public policy issues were examined.

The final elective course was the Comprehensive Review. This course is designed to prepare students to take the comprehensive review examination which is taken in lieu of submitting a thesis. The course is a capstone to the entire Master's programme and covers five main areas of

study – policy analysis, research methods, criminological theories, policing, and legal issues. The comprehensive review examination is taken over two days and requires that the student answers one essay-type question in each area of study.

CONCLUSION

The McCabe Exchange Programme exposed us in 2000 to innovative research on all aspects of policing and the criminal justice system in the United States, and to comparative aspects from around the globe. We made many great friendships with fellow students and law enforcement personnel – links that will be important going forward. This once-in-a-lifetime educational experience is recommended for anyone who wishes to enhance their understanding of the environment in which police operate and gain valuable insights into comparative police operations.

Members of An Garda Síochána now have more opportunities for further education than ever before and the McCabe Fellowship Exchange Programme is a key element in the drive to provide An Garda Síochána with knowledge, competences, and behavioural and organisation strengths to help us migrate effectively from where we are now to the future policing environment.

Medical services relating to Garda overseas service

Doctor Donal Collins, Chief Medical Officer, Garda Headquarters

Dr. Donal Collins

INTRODUCTION

Garda members are currently serving in three locations overseas

1. Cyprus (UNFICYP),
2. Bosnia Herzegovina as part of a UN Mission (UNIPTF), and
3. Macedonia as part of an Operation for Security and Co-operation in Europe mission (OSCE).

They are engaged in essential work in all these locations and the experience gained by them is very beneficial to the Garda organisation and themselves. This challenging work benefits the organisation in that it forges links to many other bodies and organisations, it provides a unique policing experience, it gives Gardaí a barometer against which to measure the excellence of policing in Ireland, and it assists the Garda service in planning for future operations.

The Medical Department of An Garda Síochána, as part of the Human Resource Management team, takes on the responsibility of the medical assessment and preparation of members for overseas service, investigates medical services available to members travelling overseas and, while continuing to liaise through the senior officer and directly with those involved, provides medical services to all members overseas and ensures optimal medical care. It is also tasked in assessing members on their return from overseas missions.

MEDICAL ASSESSMENT AND PREPARATION OF MEMBERS SELECTED TO SERVE OVERSEAS

Prior to attending the Garda Medical Department for assessment for overseas service, members will have volunteered for overseas service for many reasons, including a sense of duty to citizens of other countries, career and personal development, a sense of adventure and, for some, financial gain.

They are recommended by their supervisors and senior officers at Unit, District and Divisional levels. It is accepted that when members attend for medical assessment that they are enthusiastic about serving on overseas missions, and that officers who have recommended these members are of a firm opinion that members whom they recommend are suited to the challenges and demands which may be presented to them.

On attending the Medical Department candidates complete a detailed medical questionnaire, which may highlight a relevant past medical history and medical complaints from which they may be still suffering. They undergo a clinical examination and also undergo certain assessments such as Audiograms, Pulmonary Function Tests, Chest x-rays, ECG's, and Stress ECG's for those over 50 years of age, because of the increased incidence of cardiovascular disease in the older population.

They also undergo blood and urine tests. On occasion it is necessary to carry out more extensive tests. When all these assessments are carried out recommendations can be made as to their suitablility for overseas service.

The rationale of carrying out an extensive medical assessment is based on the belief that members are travelling to mission areas where significantly greater demands may be placed upon them than would be demanded of them in their home stations. Moreover, it is recognised that while medical services in these regions may be good and every effort is made in caring for members serving overseas, services may not be as readily accessible as they would be in their home countries.

34

THE MEDICAL PREPARATION OF MEMBERS SELECTED FOR OVERSEAS SERVICE

When members are selected for overseas service they are given appropriate vaccinations. They are also briefed on relevant medical issues by the C.M.O. or other member of the Medical Department. They are also briefed by a Psychiatrist and a Welfare Officer. In the medical brief, many issues are discussed including vaccination requirements for overseas service, issues relating to health, hygiene and safety, issues relating to infections which may be relevant in the mission area, and issues relating to accessibility to medical services overseas. Issues relating to mental health are also discussed. Members are advised of the benefits of commitment to the mission, to their fellow officers serving overseas with them and to the population whom they serve. They are also advised on the necessity to communicate well with those with whom they are working and with their family and friends at home and of the challenges which will face them and strategies to deal with loneliness and isolation. The problems in relation to alcohol etc. are pointed out and they are advised to stay in close liaison with each other, with the Senior Officer for the Region, and with the Garda Overseas Office.

The Senior Officer of the group liaises with the Officer he is replacing and seeks early meetings with the CMO and other Medical Officers in the Region responsible for their health. In the case of service in Cyprus, medical services are provided through the UN. In overseas service in Bosnia, medical services are provided through the offices of the Chief Medical Officer based in Sarajevo. In Macedonia, medical services are organised through OSCE. Various local arrangements are made in these areas. It is necessary that arrangements are updated on a regular basis so that an efficient and adequate medical service is always available.

In considering the adequacy of medical services it is important to ensure that (a) minor medical problems can be dealt with at a local level (b) that emergencies, which may arise, can be dealt with quickly and (c) that appropriate arrangements can be made or repatriation when necessary at an optimal time.

At the medical briefing members are also advised on the content of the First Aid Medical Kit, which they are given prior to travel overseas and which previous serving members have found very useful. They are also advised that this office is in regular communcation through the HRM Overseas Office with their management overseas and with medical services in the region.   To optimise medical care to members it is important that officers in charge are familiar with, and have established a good rapport with, the medical personnel in the region, and discuss the adequacy of services available.

ASSESSMENT ON RETURN TO HOME

On return to home members are reviewed by a Doctor. They are asked if they have suffered any injury or illness. They are also asked if the experience was positive and how they coped with the challenges of overseas service. If this consultation points to the need for further medical evaluation this is carried out.

35

Some time after return to home a debrief is organised. Members who have served overseas are asked to discuss their experience with a variety of people including the Medical Department. They give their views on the services which were available to them. This debriefing also assists in reviewing this service on a regular basis.

MY OWN EXPERIENCE OF OVERSEAS SERVICE

While in the Army Medical Corps, I served with the UN on five separate occasions in South Lebanon with the 54th, 59th, 66th, 70th and 83rd Irish Battalions.   I saw at first hand the great work which can be done on these missions. I noted the challenges which are presented in organising these missions overseas, the extensive planning required, and the great co-operation which exists between the many different nationalities involved in these missions. I also saw the difficulties which can arise and the support needed from medical and other support services.

The medical services to Battalions overseas was provided by Primary Care Physicians in the various Battalions including the Irish Battalion. More specialised care was provided to the earlier Battalions by SWED. MED. COY - Swedish Medical Field Company, who brought specialists such as Surgeons, Anaesthetists, Radiologists etc to serve overseas. When further care was required it was possible to access this from hospitals in Israel and also on occasion from hospitals within Lebanon. In later Battalions more specialised care was provided, led by POL. MED. COY. – A Polish Medical Field Company. As a Medical Officer serving overseas, it was necessary for me to establish a good rapport with the Swedish and later the Polish Services. Despite language difficulties the co-operative effect between the various nationalities provided a good medical service.

36

In the past year I visited Bosnia. This visit to Bosnia was organised because of concerns amongst various nationalities serving overseas in relation to previous use of Depleted Uranium (DU) in the region. I travelled overseas in the company of Sergeant Jim O'Halloran, then of the Garda Medical Department and Garda Michael Keating of the Forensic Department.

Prior to travel we carried out significant research into Depleted Uranium. We received great help and co operation from our own organisation and also from the Defence Forces, the RPI (Radiological Protection Institute of Ireland), The Department of Epidemiogy UCD, and the Physics Department of UCD. Transport was organised by Superintendent John Murphy, the Irish Contingent Commander in Bosnia. We travelled to many locations where the members were serving and carried out ambient radiation measurements at all these sites, and collected soil, water and vegetation samples which were later analysed by the RPI and the State Laboratory. Happily the results of these analysis were reassuring.

This visit to Bosnia also allowed me to see at first hand the service available to members serving in Bosnia. It also allowed me to have discussions in relation to medical services with the CMO to the region, and the senior officer, at the time Superintendent John Murphy who introduce me to the Health and Safety Cell in Sarajevo. This Health and Safety Cell was very well organised and financed and was very helpful to us.

In contrast to Army Battalions serving overseas the members are provided with medical service by a CMO to the region and other civilian medical personnel employed by the UN and other organisations. When necessary they also access the local hospital system.

Modern communication systems such as e-mail and mobile phones assist greatly in communicating with personnel serving overseas, with Officers in Charge and with Doctors providing care in the region.

CONCLUSION
An Garda Síochána and the Irish Defence Forces have served with great distinction in many troubled areas of the world for many years. They have gained experience and work in co-operation with other nationalities in UN missions, OSCE missions, and will shortly serve an EU-led mission. These missions will continue to present a challenge to our resources and our ability to co-operate with other nationalities in effecting resolution of many conflicts. The Medical Department as part of the HRM team will, based on a wealth of experience, make every effort to support members serving overseas in the future and will provide medical services before, during, and after overseas missions. These missions make the world safer for all of us. And those who serve on them merit the very best medical support we can provide.

Economic and social assessment of one-man Garda stations

John Kelly

Superintendent John Kelly

INTRODUCTION

Service outside the Dublin Metropolitan Region and the other major cities provides unique insights into the role of the one-man Garda Station in the provision of a policing service in the rural community. The contrast between the role of one-man stations and their larger counterparts is especially evident to those who have served in busy city-centre stations. At first sight it seems that the continuation of one-man stations into this century is questionable at a time when there will be increasing efficiency and effectiveness demands. But the question is not that easily resolved.

The question cannot be resolved without analysing the historic context within which one-man stations account for approximately 28 per cent of all stations in use today. Many factors which determined the opening or closures of stations in the past are still relevant. Population patterns, mobility, economic well-being, quality of life factors, and the communications infrastructure may have altered radically, but many of the factors which shaped the decisions of the past still feature today.

There is vast information contained in the Garda archives relating to the early decades of the organisation. The transition from Royal Irish Constabulary Barracks to the stations of today, highlight in detail the work undertaken by the rural stations in the early years and the successive attempts at rationalisation that were made and achieved. The Irish experience of the one-man station is not entirely unique. Police forces across the EU and especially in the United Kingdom, have, to varying extents, also been dealing with this issue. The siting, manning, resourcing and service delivery from the one-man station has helped greatly the community acceptance of Gardaí as a civilian police service which is uniquely closest to the people it serves. Ireland is the third most sparsely populated of the EU member states. Population density in Denmark, for example, is twice as high. Urbanisation has been a relatively recent phenomenon. Almost half the population lived in a rural setting as recently as 1960.

THE EVOLUTION OF THE GARDA STATION FROM 1919 TO THE PRESENT

In 1919 the strength of the RIC was 10,000, spread out through 1,129 heavily fortified barracks. With the General Election in January 1919 and the call for a boycott of the R.I.C. between June and September 1919, many RIC barracks were attacked and burnt. By early 1920, the number of barracks in the country had been reduced by half.

On 22nd February 1922, following a meeting held in the Gresham Hotel Dublin on the 9th February, 1922, the civic guard was established to replace the RIC. This new Force, renamed the Garda Síochána on 8th

37

communiqué

AN GARDA SÍOCHÁNA MANAGEMENT JOURNAL

38

August 1923 would be centrally controlled and responsible to Government, unarmed and non-political. It was proposed that there should be 807 Garda Stations, as compared with 1,129 stations occupied by the R.I.C. outside the six counties. A Bill was introduced to legalise the new Police Force. Provision was made for a fixed strength to man 401 Garda Stations.

In some places, they were welcomed, in others they were snubbed. But, in time, they gained acceptance from the local community. The Government of the day cemented the image of the Civic Guard as a civilian police force by off-loading administration duties to them. Taking rainfall readings, compiling agricultural statistics and a range of other similar non-core police duties soon became the norm. Garda participation in local organisations and sporting groups also helped them to integrate with the people. To this day, the exceptionally high level of non-confrontational contact between An Garda Síochána and the community it serves is one of its key values. This value, closeness to the community, results in a higher level of criminal intelligence, greater cooperation and assistance and a higher detection rate. By February 1924 An Garda Síochána were in occupation of 675 stations and by July the same year, the Force had occupied 777 stations, excluding the Dublin Metropolitan Area. By June 1926, the number of stations occupied grew to 887.

THE EARLY YEARS

The very poor working conditions of the early years brought An Garda Síochána into conflict with Government. As late as 1952, the Garda Síochána still maintained the traditions of the RIC which postulated a life in barracks for every man not specifically authorised to live out. The rise in married Gardaí moving into the rented sector or becoming house owners was the start of the break up of the single unit of station and living accommodation.

In reviewing the establishment file for the early years, there were some noteworthy texts which mirrored the early perceptions on policing. A Commission report to Government in 1929 noted

> *Public house duty is not so formidable in the towns and villages, where Garda Station are situated, but where the public houses are to be found in isolated places, several miles from the Garda Station, the duty of effective supervision is heavy.*

The report continued

> *. . . owing to the large number of public houses in the country and the poverty of many of the publicans, they are all the more inclined to break the law.*

In 1925, there were 12,427 Public Houses in Ireland. Nowadays there are just over 10,000.

Seven years into the new Force the lack of recruitment, resignations, and the formation of Special Branch in the Dublin Metropolitan Area brought to the fore the issue of station closures – all in rural locations. The Commissioner of the day resisted the closures, citing that the

Garda is the only visible feature of the executive forces of the Government, in most areas and once withdrawn, it means withdrawal of the Government contact with the people, with consequent loss of prestige to Government.

He outlined the various opposition groups, written representations and economic considerations. A newspaper article (Irish Independent 21st November 1929) noted that

39

the varied representations made, were probably one of the greatest tributes that could be paid to the popularity of the Garda and to the efficiency of their work.

On the 4th December 1929, the Department of Justice considered the submitted list of stations for closure and ordered the closure of twenty-four Garda Stations. One of those station closed – Leixlip, Co. Kildare - is now the largest populated town in Co. Kildare.

Examination of the archive files gives us a picture of policing in rural Ireland, where the principle activities related to:
• Patrolling on foot/bicycle
• School Attendance Act Enforcement
• Service of juror summons
• Attendance at District/Coroner Court
• Monthly fairs/markets
• Livestock movements at railway stations
• Barrack Orderly duties
• Delivery of official documents – (161,000 pension books delivered annually).
• Compiling Agricultural statistics

In the Committee of Inquiry held in 1950, it was stated that the rural countryside was patrolled on bicycle, with most Gardaí cycling about 12-18 miles per day, on patrol. That patrol was continually interrupted by visits of a social and professional nature, to houses along the route. An entry in a station diary in Tipperary in 1929, reveals the type of this rural patrol –

on duty in the village, entered several houses, met and conversed with some people, made discreet enquiries – nothing of any importance occurred.

A RURAL PROFILE
Currently, the delivery of a rural policing service is governed by the placement of 199 one-man Garda Stations, spread among the structured Garda Districts. The figure represents 28 per cent of the Garda station estate. These rural policing units have a number of common features:

- The average population ranges between 1,000 – 2,000 persons.
- The average distance from a one-man Station to District Headquarters is 8 miles.
- Over 40 per cent of all stations are located on secondary roads, with less than 20 per cent located on national primary road routes.
- Almost 84 per cent have a post office, located in the same rural policing locations.
- Almost 80 per cent have a community centre forming part of the village structure.
- Average daily opening hours is 2.2 hours – 11.6 hours average weekly opening hours.
- Average maintenance costs are low for a basic policing unit.

ONE-MAN STATION ACTIVITY SURVEY

An activity survey of 30 one-man stations was undertaken in 2000. The listed demands for service were common with similar surveys undertaken by several UK Police Forces to measure the Public/Police interaction. During one week thirty stations and 2269 activities were recorded and the major categories of activity were

1. Document witnessed — 19 per cent
2. Other business — 17 per cent
3. Firearm enquiry — 13 per cent
4. Collecting Form — 11 per cent
5. Non-crime incident — 10 per cent
6. Pay Fee/Fine — 8 per cent
7. Seek Information — 7 per cent
8. Produce D/L/Insurance Cert. — 4 per cent
9. Make statement — 3 per cent
10. Report crime/incident — 3 per cent
11. Lost property — 2 per cent
12. Traffic accident — 1 per cent
13. Missing animal — 1 per cent
14. Collection permit — 1 per cent

In the same survey, the periods when the public most called to the station were:

10 am. – 2 pm.

8 pm. – 10 pm.

Limited opening hours might dictate these two periods rather than the clear preference of callers.

Traditionally, the Police have allocated resources in line with their operational requirements – with most resources distributed to respond to demand and on the basis of the likelihood of success and cost-effectiveness. Evaluations of output and outcomes, high professional standards, performance indicators, cost effectiveness analysis, and the importance of proactive policing to ensure that it provides both an

efficient and effective use of resources are now key objectives. Valuing the benefits of policing activity is getting easier to measure. The crime detection rate, road deaths rate, drug supply detections, quality of response to emergencies, security threat containment, public disorder control and level of support offered to victims by Gardaí are all important barometers of policing activity which are measured in our yearly evaluation of policing plans. Public attitude surveys in recent years give us a very clear and complete picture of what the public want their police to prioritise.

Foot patrol is highly valued in public attitude surveys and An Garda Síochána has recently examined foot and beat patrols. Regional Commissioners are now acting to increase patrol visibility. People want a balance between visible, reassuring, foot patrols and fast mobile emergency response. The foot patrol

41

- Deters crime and gathers intelligence
- Builds public confidence
- Ensures a feel good factor for the public
- Builds trust and relationships
- Shows the human face of the organisation

The advice of a senior police officer addressing the village policeman on assignment was typically, "this is your village – you look after it". The rural Garda knows his area intimately, is a figure of authority, prevents trouble and uses his discretion. The negative elements of the village environment is that the cost base, capital, maintenance and salary are extremely difficult to justify, if policing activities and policing achievements are the measurement. Crime prevention is a measurement, but measuring prevented crime is notoriously difficult.

An Garda Síochána is required to draw up corporate strategy and policing plans to produce effective customer-driven policing service delivery for the future. The rural Garda Station of the future will be characterised by:

- Greater integration of services with partner agencies.
- Policing that is closer to the public.
- Fewer, more flexible buildings.
- Regionalisation
- Increased use of technology.
- More flexible styles of working
- Value for money, activity-costed and
- Customer focused policing services

Automated customer access points using computer technology could enhance the Garda service's service provision in the future.

The public still considers the local Garda as one of their own and these are characteristics of that relationship:

- Confide in him, not a stranger.

- Cultivating and enhancement of good community relations.
- An integral part of the local community.
- Ageing rural population.
- Information is and always will be the fuel that keeps a police service moving regardless of new technology and ideas.
- Affordable house – commuting to work.

WHAT DOES THE FUTURE HOLD FOR RURAL GARDA STATIONS?

The closures of the stations in the late 1920s, 1940s and 1950s were prompted by a shortage of human resources at times of straitened and shrinking public expenditure. The annual maintenance budget for the Garda estate is quite low. Average running costs and maintenance cost for one-man stations is also low, in the overall Garda budget.

Apart from the social and activities rating of a one-man station, the outcome of an in-depth cost benefit analysis lies at the heart of determining the future role of the one-man station. A cost-benefit analysis measures in cash terms not only the budget implications, but the cash value of social gain to the community in terms of improved quality of life. Identifying and meeting public expectations are central to the success of every organisation. Meeting public expectations in the general sense is a considerable challenge to a policing organisation because expectations are so high and because the service is provided free at the point of delivery – therefore demand can frequently exceed our capacity to deliver. Examination of the establishment files of the day on the closures in 1929 indicated the extent of resistance and concerns of rural communities to the proposed station closures. That historical resistance is likely to be at least as strong and effective today. And today's media is very unlike the media of 1929. These are simple big-P and small-p political realities within which policing must be formulated.

Irish policing history describes the wide range of non-core roles and functions that have been delivered by Gardaí from the earliest years. The report of the Steering Group on the Efficiency and Effectiveness of the Garda Síochána 1997 advocated a study of the economic and social consequences of transferring non-core roles and functions from An Garda Síochána to other agencies. The 1997 Deloitte Touche Review acknowledged that some station openings are geared to unemployment certification and other extraneous duties. To whatever extent reporting a crime is seen as one of the most important core policing activities, it illustrates a situation where crime investigation is far from the central activity in most rural one-man stations. The important issue relates to the fact that the community knows 'their Garda'. It may well be that local Garda managers and the community alike see his or her attachment to the station as the reason for the long historic relationship between the Garda in the one-man station and his or her community. Indeed it is not

42

unknown for a local community to resist the transfer of the local member. This is further reinforced where the member lives either in the station or elsewhere within the community. Technology advances such as a vastly increased phone network, mobile phones and increased car mobility available to both the community and the policing services modify the need for a rural community to make visits to a station. The evidence is from attitude surveys is that personal callers now form a very much smaller proportion of public-Garda contacts.

CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS

There is now a need to commission an activity analysis of a sufficiently large sample of one-man stations to establish the level of activity and to complete an activity analysis of 24-hour stations to identify the times of day most people prefer to call to their station. The level of activity could establish thresholds upon which to base a decision on retention of a station, or changes in opening hours. A cost benefit analysis would provide an accurate estimate of the true value of the service delivered.

Policing in Ireland has changed dramatically from the earliest model. This review strategy could, through a micro-examination of their core functions versus demands for service and cost, determine the value of one-man stations to the overall national policing strategy and to the thousands of people who use them. It will provide all the accurate information necessary to reach an informed, effective decision, following informed debate on the subject.

The one-man station gives An Garda Síochána a valuable additional reach, is a key component of our organisation boundary, and is a part of what makes Ireland special. These stations deliver a higher quality of life to the community we serve. Can that quality of life and quality of service be improved? Will the door close for the last time in some one-man stations?   Or will policing become part of a shared multi-agency community service operating from a community centre with the post office, community centre, medical centre, and a range of other central and local Government offices?

Commuting congestion and a range of other urban problems today reduce the quality of urban life in our cities. This has sparked a wave of movement to rural Ireland, just as a lack of available services was once one of the factors which sparked a wave of movement to urban Ireland. Rural Garda stations, post offices, churches, shops, pubs, playing fields, communications services and a transport infrastructure are all essential elements supporting a higher quality of life in rural Ireland. If we lose any of them our social mobility will be diminished and, with it, our ability to respond to whatever the future brings us. But privately and publicly provided services have to be delivered cost-effectively to a higher quality

43

standard to meet raised expectations. Ireland has never been in a better position to achieve both simultaneously, but some change is inevitable, and not every element in every rural community will survive.

44

REFERENCES

McNiffe. L. (1998) A history of the Garda Síochána. Wolfhound Press, Dublin.

Greater Manchester Police (1998) A Blueprint for the Next Century – unpublished.

Stockdale J.E. Whitehead C.M.E. Gresham. P.J. (1999) Applying Economic Evaluation to Policing Activity, Policing and Reducing Crime – Home Office Police Research Series Paper 103.

Police Review (1991) The Pounds and Pence of Policing – the Voice of the Service.

Police Review (1999) Station Regeneration

Stationery Office (1950) Committee of Inquiry into An Garda Síochána.

Garda Archives (1923-1929) Garda Establishment Scheme (Ref. 44.G.173/30).

Tupman B. Tupman A. (1995) Policing in Europe – Uniform in Diversity, Intellect Books, London.

Home Office (1999) Policing: Serving the Community

Ryan L. (1998) Policing in a Changing Society. Communique – An Garda Síochána Management Journal.

Northamptonshire Police (1999) Project 2000 and Beyond, unpublished.

Home Office (1998) Public Expectations and Perceptions of Policing, Policing and Reducing Crime, Police Research Series Paper 96.

Lancashire Constabulary (1998) Redundant Police Stations, unpublished.

Government Publications (1997) Report of the Steering Group of the Efficiency and Effectiveness of the Garda Síochána.

Deloitte and Touche (1997) Review of An Garda Síochána

Audit Commission (1999) Stations – Improving the Management of the Police Estates

Garda Archives (1929) Station Diary, Tipperary, unpublished.

Morgan, R Newburn T (1997) The Future of Policing, Clarendon Press, Oxford.

Breathnach S. (1974) The Irish Police from Earliest Times, to the Present Day. Anvil Books.

Villiers P. (1995) Without Fear or Favour. Policing A Changing Democracy. Athenaeum Press, Gateshead, Tyne and Wear.